

Microbiological Interactions with Cold Plasma

Bourke, P., Zuizina, D., Han, L., Cullen, P. J., & Gilmore, B. F. (2018). Microbiological Interactions with Cold Plasma. *Journal of Applied Microbiology*, *123*(2), 308-324. https://doi.org/10.1111/jam.13429

Published in: Journal of Applied Microbiology

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights

© 2017 The Society for Applied Microbiology. This work is made available online in accordance with the publisher's policies. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

Open Access

This research has been made openly available by Queen's academics and its Open Research team. We would love to hear how access to this research benefits you. – Share your feedback with us: http://go.qub.ac.uk/oa-feedback

Received Date : 25-Oct-2016

Revised Date : 31-Jan-2017

Accepted Date : 13-Feb-2017

Article type : Review Article

Microbiological Interactions with Cold Plasma

Paula Bourke^{1*}, Dana Zuizina¹, Lu Han¹, PJ Cullen^{1,2}, Brendan F. Gilmore^{3*}

¹Plasma Research Group, School of Food Science and Environmental Health, Dublin Institute of Technology, Dublin 1, Ireland

²School of Chemical Engineering, UNSW, Sydney, Australia

³School of Pharmacy, Queen's University Belfast, Medical Biology Centre, Belfast, UK

Running Title: Cold Plasma Microbiology

Summary

There is a diverse range of microbiological challenges facing the food, healthcare and clinical sectors. The increasing and pervasive resistance to broad-spectrum antibiotics and health related concerns with many biocidal agents drives research for novel and complementary antimicrobial approaches. Biofilms display increased mechanical and antimicrobial stability and are the subject of extensive research. Cold plasmas (CP) have rapidly evolved as a technology for microbial decontamination, wound healing and cancer treatment, owing to the

This article has been accepted for publication and undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as doi: 10.1111/jam.13429

chemical and bio-active radicals generated known collectively as reactive oxygen (ROS) and nitrogen species (RONS). This review outlines the basics of CP technology and discusses interactions with a range of microbiological targets. Advances in mechanistic insights are presented and applications to food and clinical issues are discussed. The possibility of tailoring CP to control specific microbiological challenges is apparent. This review focuses on microbiological issues in relation to food and health care associated human infections, the role of CP in their elimination and the current status of plasma mechanisms of action.

Keywords: Cold plasma technology, Microbiological interactions, Mechanism of action, Anti-microbial resistance, Biofilms, Food, Healthcare.

What is cold plasma?

Plasma is commonly referred to as the fourth state of matter where increases in the material's energy levels converts its state from solid to liquid to gas and ultimately to an ionised state of the gas, "plasma", which exhibits unique properties. Cold plasma (CP) is comprised of several excited atomic, molecular, ionic, and radical species, co-existing with numerous reactive species, including electrons, positive and negative ions, free radicals, gas atoms, molecules in the ground or excited state and quanta of electromagnetic radiation (UV photons and visible light). Depending on the generation conditions, plasma can be classified into low-, atmospheric- or high-pressure and also subdivided into thermal and non-thermal plasmas. Furthermore, non-thermal plasma or CP can be generated from either atmospheric pressure therefore called atmospheric CP (ACP), or low pressure, where both plasmas generate similar reactive species and same electron densities range, thus possess similar microbial inactivation mechanisms (Zhang *et al.* 2013). Thermal plasma can be generated by heating the gas to high

temperatures, which may exceed several thousands of Kelvins, where all the constituent chemical species, electrons and ions exist in a thermodynamic equilibrium (Moreau *et al.* 2008; Wan *et al.* 2009; Misra *et al.* 2011; Banu *et al.* 2012; Niemira 2012; Scholtz *et al.* 2015). In contrast, CP are characterised by non-equilibrium, where cooling of the ions and uncharged molecules is significantly more effective than that of energy transfer from electrons resulting in the gas remaining at a low temperature (Niemira 2012; Scholtz *et al.* 2015).

Common types of plasma devices

The application of a strong electromagnetic field to a neutral gas that induces ionisation is the most commonly used method of generating CP (Banu *et al.* 2012). CP may be obtained by a diversity of electrical discharges, such as corona discharge, micro hollow cathode discharge, gliding arc discharge, one atmospheric uniform glow discharge, dielectric barrier discharge, atmospheric pressure plasma jet and plasma needle. The type of plasma source will generally influence the technological application along with the composition and abundance of the chemical species produced (Nehra *et al.* 2008; Scholtz *et al.* 2015). For environmental, biological and biomedical applications the dielectric barrier discharge (DBD) and plasma jet are the two most commonly used forms of CP generation (**Fig. 1**). This is primarily due to their simple design and the possibility of reconfiguration to suit many types of targets and treatment requirements.

Mechanisms of action of cold plasma

The chemical composition of CP is complex, and multiple different reactive agents are expected to play a role, independently or in synergy, in inactivation of microbial targets. In general, the composition and thus the efficacy of CP will depend on the device design and system operating parameters, such as gas composition, flow rate, moisture, temperature, voltage and frequency (Dobrynin *et al.* 2009; Wan *et al.* 2009; Ehlbeck *et al.* 2011).

Atmospheric air CP is an excellent source of electrons and positive and negative ions, free radicals, stable conversion products (e.g. ozone), excited atoms and molecules, and ultraviolet radiation (UV) photons (Stoffels *et al.* 2008). The majority of reactive species produced by the commonly used plasma sources include electronically and vibrationally excited oxygen O_2 and nitrogen N_2 ; active forms of oxygen molecules and atoms, i.e. reactive oxygen species (ROS), such as atomic oxygen O, singlet oxygen ${}^{1}O_2$, superoxide anion O_2^{-} and ozone O_3 ; reactive nitrogen species (RNS), such as atomic nitrogen N, excited nitrogen $N_2(A)$, nitric oxide NO•; if humidity is present H_2O^+ , OH^- anion, OH_{\bullet} radical or H_2O_2 are also generated (Scholtz *et al.* 2015). The exact mechanisms of CP mediated bacterial inactivation are still under investigation, but several generated products have been demonstrated to play a role. These products include ROS, RNS, UV radiation and charged particles within a plasma gas phase. Among the ROS, ozone, atomic oxygen, singlet oxygen, superoxide, peroxide, and hydroxyl radicals, are considered to be involved in bacterial inactivation (Joshi *et al.* 2011; Alkawareek *et al.* 2012).

Most bacteria, particularly, anaerobes are considered to be very sensitive to ROS species (Stoffels *et al.* 2008). The diffusion of oxygen species or oxygen containing radicals (nitric oxide) through a bacteria cell wall causes local damage possibly by oxidation of cytoplasmic membrane, protein and DNA strands (Gallagher *et al.* 2007). Joshi *et al.* (2011) reported that singlet oxygen and hydrogen peroxide species were responsible for membrane lipid peroxidation, as ROS scavengers significantly reduced the oxidative damage of *E. coli* DNA. Moreover, the inactivation efficacy of RNS can be stimulated with the presence of ROS, which indicated the importance of oxygen blend in working gases (Boxhammer et al., 2012). Sureshkumar *et al.* (2010) demonstrated that adding 2% oxygen to nitrogen gas resulted in the formation of nitric oxides, which significantly enhanced the inactivation effect. The presence of these reactive species was confirmed by optical emission spectroscopy.

Bombardment on the cell wall by charged particles, electrons and ions can break chemical bonds, cause erosion through etching, formation of lesions and openings in the membranes, inducing further penetration of plasma toxic compounds inside a bacterial cell (Gallagher et al. 2007; Moreau et al. 2008). Inactivation through erosion is believed to be easier to achieve in Gram-negative bacteria, due to the vulnerability of the cell wall, compared with Grampositive species with a thicker membrane structure (Stoffels et al. 2008). However, the intracellular damage was more obvious in Gram-positive bacteria as a result of higher intracellular ROS level (Han et al. 2015). Another significant role in the mechanical disruption of bacterial cell membrane is the effect of charged particles, which is widely classified in literature as direct and indirect (Dobrynin et al. 2009). Indirect treatment design employs distance or metal mesh to avoid direct contact of charged particles with samples. The charged particles do not largely participate in treatment but recombine before reaching the sample (Laroussi 2009). With direct contact, charged particles could accumulate on surface and cause electrostatic stress. This could lead to morphology changes by overcoming the tensile strength of cell membrane (Mendis et al. 2000; Laroussi et al. 2003). Cell membrane perforation caused by etching will enhance the diffusion of secondary reactive species that might be formed in the plasma discharge inside the cell. Etching, as a result of reaction between the excited atoms/molecules and radicals and organic materials causes breakdown of bonds, particularly for hydrocarbon compounds. This in turn will lead to the formation of molecular fragments and volatile compounds emanating from the cells, causing morphological changes, ranging from reduction in cell size to the appearance of deep channels in the cell, up to complete cellular destruction. Atomic oxygen and ozone easily react with these open bonds, which facilitates a faster etching of molecules (Ermolaeva et al. 2011; Fricke et al. 2012). This erosion effect leading from the cleavage of chemical bonds can also lead to the demise of microbial support structures such as biofilms. Graves (2014)

proposed a model, which emphasised the importance of the biological systems adaptive response, thus recognising that a biological systems response may occur over a longer time and space scale than the initial exposure to plasma reactive species. Figure 2 further illustrates the complexity of microbial inactivation mechanisms with plasma reactive species. Despite the extensive research on the antimicrobial effects of CP, it is necessary to consider this technology in tandem with the nature of the microbial contamination presented in foods, their processing environments as well as clinical and healthcare situations to elucidate how the mechanisms and mode of delivery may be optimized to provide effective alternative antimicrobial technologies.

Cold plasma for food safety applications

Bacterial pathogens are considered a critical food safety issue, followed by foodborne viruses, bacterial toxins, pesticide residues and mycotoxins (van Boxstael *et al.* 2013). Most reporting countries identify *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella* spp. as the target pathogens of concern (Raybaudi-Massilia *et al.* 2009; Olaimat and Holley 2012). In addition the bacterial capacity for biofilm formation, internalisation of contaminating cells within a host tissue or structure and/or formation of highly resistant spores often complicate or negate food disinfection processes (**Fig. 3**). CP technology has been demonstrated as a potential alternative to conventional methods attributable to its non-thermal nature, its proven potential to enhance microbiological safety and maintain quality characteristics of a wide range of foods within fast processing times. CP has been studied for decontamination of many food groups including fresh fruits and vegetables, meat and meat products, milk and dairy products, egg and egg products, seafood, fruit juices, powdered products, nuts, cereals and grains. Advantages that broaden the scope for food processing include reduced water usage, lack of chemical residue and use of atmospheric air as a working gas. The compatibility with other food processing unit operations aids the

development of large-scale systems for different commodities. The interactions between CP treatment, the effector molecules and microorganisms are complex and depend on numerous system, process and target parameters. These include plasma device, voltage level, frequency, working gas, gas flow rate, humidity level, distance between the target and plasma emitter, type of product, surface characteristics and volume in addition to the type, concentration and physiological state of microorganisms. This complexity makes comparisons in reported efficacies difficult (**Fig. 4**).

Inactivation of food borne pathogenic microorganisms

The mode of exposure and type of system configuration significantly impact on antimicrobial efficacy. Hertwig et al. (2015) compared direct plasma treatment using a radio frequency argon plasma jet to a remote treatment using a microwave generated air plasma for effects on Salmonella inoculated on whole black pepper with higher bactericidal effects achieved using remote air plasma. In air plasmas, both reactive nitrogen and reactive oxygen species are generated, which directly impact on microorganisms and can lead to their inactivation. Reactive nitrogen species can accumulate on the microbial surface and easily diffuse through cell membranes, causing a decrease of intracellular pH. The intracellular pH plays a major role in cell function and affects enzyme activity, reaction rates, protein stability and structure of nucleic acids (Hertwig et al. 2015). It has been demonstrated that using a contained ACP system, which facilitates the post treatment retention of reactive species can enhance the antimicrobial efficacy for decontamination of fresh foods (Ziuzina et al. 2014). Kim et al. (2013) established that the distance between samples and plasma emitter as well as position of meat samples during plasma exposure played a crucial role in inactivation efficiency of treatment against S. Typhimurium. A distance of 20 mm using double sided treatments for 2.5 min of chicken breasts had greater inactivation than a single-side treatment for 5 min with similar patterns observed for pork loin.

The main advantages of low pressure CP generation approach are the possibility to avoid arching (as a result of the use of lower voltage levels for generation of plasma), which may damage fragile surfaces such as fresh produce surfaces and suitability for the treatment of pre-packed produce using a low pressure vacuum (Zhang et al. 2013). In the decontamination of shell eggs, Mok and Song (2013) used air generated low-pressure discharge plasma and achieved a 6 log reduction of Salmonella Typhimurium after 5 min of treatment. In this study, the working gas used for generation of plasma played a vital role in inactivation effects, with the highest inactivation achieved using air following by oxygen and nitrogen. Importantly, the bacterial reductions were achieved with no denaturation of either the egg white or yolk. In a study conducted by Ragni et al. (2010), inoculated shell eggs were treated in a plasma after-glow chamber generated using resistive barrier discharge. Reductions by up to 4.5 and 3.5 log units were observed for S. Entertitidis and S. Typhimurium, respectively, using air with higher moisture contents (65%) and treatment time of 90 min. This demonstrates the critical role of humidity level for achieving effective microbiological control with CP. The enhanced effect of increased relative humidity (RH) on the efficiency of inactivation was attributed to the presence of oxygen reactive species (ROS) as detected in the discharge emission spectra. An increase in OH radical irradiance in the emission spectrum using a humid atmosphere, which mainly results from the direct dissociation of water molecules by electron impact and is a function of the concentration of water vapour, was recorded. Although a considerable treatment time was required to significantly reduce Salmonella populations on eggs, treatment using a plasma after-glow chamber also provides gentle conditions during processing, thus minimizing changes in egg quality traits (Ragni et al. 2010).

In line with the demands of modern consumption, the control of pathogens on heat sensitive fresh foods drives research in non-thermal approaches. CP research has focused on the

microbiological safety of fresh produce as they remain a major vehicle for transmission of food borne diseases. CP has been investigated for control of Salmonella on lettuce, spinach, tomatoes, apples and strawberries. Fernandez et al. (2013), found that the inactivation rate of S. Typhimurium was independent of growth phase or growth temperature and that 15 min of ACP treatment was required to achieve 2.72 log reductions of viability of cells on lettuce using a nitrogen plasma jet system. The authors reported an effect of produce surface with reduced inactivation efficiency reported for strawberry and potato by comparison with lettuce. Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) studies have revealed that different food surface characteristics such as the convolutions of strawberry surfaces and the walls of the eukaryotic cells of potato tissue, could obscure bacterial cells and create physical barriers that are mitigate the efficacy of ACP inactivation, whereas smooth surfaces such as cherry tomatoes facilitated rapid inactivation times (Fernandez et al. 2013; Ziuzina et al. 2014). In contrast, Zhang et al (2013), found that the antimicrobial efficacy of 10 minute low-pressure oxygen plasma treatment was unaffected by product surface interactions. The authors reported that treatment time and plasma energy density were critical for high inactivation rates against S. Typhimurium inoculated on spinach (rough hydrophobic), lettuce (smooth hydrophilic), tomato (smooth hydrophobic) and potato (rough hydrophilic) surfaces. Higher plasma energy densities can give rise to higher intensities of UV irradiation, UV photons, and plasma reactive species thereby enhancing bactericidal properties of treatment. However, care should be taken when longer treatments are applied as fresh food quality characteristics may be altered (Zhang et al. 2013).

In 2013, in the EU, 6,043 confirmed cases of verocytotoxigenic *E. coli* (VTEC) infections resulting in 13 deaths were reported (EFSA, 2015). Enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* O157:H7 is recognised as the most predominant serotype, causing severe illness in humans. Prieto-Calvo *et al.* (2016) reported that strains of the serotype O157 were in general more resistant to food-

related stresses, such as acid, alkaline, heat, high hydrostatic pressure, UV and ACP, than strains of other serotypes when they had a functional RpoS (a global regulator of the general stress response in Gram-negative bacteria such as VTEC). Applying a high voltage AC atmospheric corona discharge system to milk reduced suspended *E. coli* by almost 4 log cycle (54%) after 20 min of plasma application, regardless of the fat content of the milk and no viable cells were detected after 6 weeks (Gurol *et al.* 2012).

Klockow and Keener (2009), exposed whole spinach leaves inoculated with E. coli to 5 min of in package DBD plasma, where employing a post-treatment storage time for 24 h yielded optimum inactivations ranging from 3-5 log CFU/leaf. Bermudez-Aguirre et al. (2013) reported the effect of treatment time (30 s to 10 min) and voltage level (3.95 kV up to 12.83 kV) using an argon plasma needle array reactor on *E. coli* populations on a range of produce surfaces. Combining higher voltage level and extended treatment time was more effective in microbial inactivation (1.6 log) when associated with lower initial bacterial counts and smoother substrate surface (tomatoes, followed by lettuce, were easier to disinfect than carrots). SEM analysis showed the major structural damage to E. coli cells, with disruption and loss of thin cell membrane surrounding the cytoplasmic content, perforations on the membrane and surface and inner components of the cell due to the action of ACP electric field and other charged particles, thus promoting cellular death. A correlation between increasing surface complexity and a reduced ACP antimicrobial efficiency was further established by Butscher et al. (2016). In this work, E. coli inoculated on alfalfa, onion, radish and cress seeds was exposed to argon plasma generated in an atmospheric pressure pulsed DBD system. While 10 min of treatment (longest treatment duration at 10 kHz, 8 kV, 500 ns pulses) caused the reduction of *E. coli* on onion seeds by 1.4 log, the identical treatment conditions resulted in a 3.4 log reduction of cells on cress seeds. SEM analysis illustrated the multiple cracks in onion seeds, which may shelter microorganisms and protect them from the

surface concentrated effects of dry plasma treatment. Similarly, complex surface properties significantly affected decontamination efficacy of ACP against E. coli inoculated on fresh produce (Ziuzina et al. 2014, Baier et al. 2015). With regards to moisture content, 17% was found to be an optimum for the decontamination of seeds, as compared to either 8 or 30% (Butscher *et al.* 2016). This was attributed to the chemistry reactions generated in the liquid phase, which can result in the formation of more stable secondary reactive species and the acidification of the milieu with combined lethality to microorganisms. Different strain responses to plasma treatment have been reported. Argon plasma treatment for 1 minute reduced E. coli O157:H7 levels on the surface of corn salad leaves by 3.3 log, whereas 2 min of treatment was required to reduce E. coli O104:H4 to similar levels (Baier et al. 2016). Generally, these studies indicate that CP can effect good inactivation of E. coli for liquid and solid food products. Whilst complex surface characteristics pose a major challenge to the decontamination efficacy of plasma, improvements are possible through retention of active species using in package design as well as optimisation of parameters such as treatment duration, treatment regime, discharge moisture content and plasma inducer gas composition. *Listeria* spp. are ubiquitous, tolerant to extreme conditions such as low pH, low temperature and high salt conditions, and are found in a variety of food and environmental matrices (Jeyaletchumi et al. 2010) often as a post processing contaminant. Song et al. (2009) demonstrated >8 log CFU/g reductions using air ACP against a three-strain cocktail of L. monocytogenes inoculated on sliced cheese in association with an input power of 150 W and treatment time of 2 min. The efficacy of treatment was largely influenced by the food characteristics examined, with only 1.73 log CFU/g reductions achieved when bacteria was inoculated on ham. Besides AC voltage and excitation frequency, Noriega et al. (2011) investigated the effect of the presence of oxygen in the carrier gas on inactivation efficacy of ACP against L. innocua inoculated on chicken muscle and skin. Higher voltage and

frequency levels and the presence of oxygen in the carrier gas resulted in the greatest inactivation efficiency, where > 3 log reduction was achieved after 4 min of treatment on muscle, however, 8 min of treatment was required to achieve 1 log reduction on skin. SEM images of chicken muscle and skin revealed surface features wherein bacteria could effectively be protected from the chemical species generated within the gas plasma. In contrast, no significant effects of treatment time and power intensity on decontamination effects of treatment was found by Rod *et al.* (2012) when ACP was evaluated against *L. innocua* inoculated on sliced ready to eat meat product, bresaola. Applying multiple treatments with a 10 min interval increased inactivation in line with increasing the number of treatments. The reported results involving different foods clearly indicate that the inactivation effect of plasma treatment on *Listeria* is dependent not only on plasma treatment conditions but also on the type of foods and their inherent surface characteristics, which has to be always considered to achieve efficient microbial inactivation with plasma systems.

The target cell characteristic is also an important factor to be considered for the achievement of efficient decontamination with plasma technology. Han *et al.* (2015) proposed a model where the mechanisms of action against Gram-positive and Gram-negative microorganisms differed. Ziuzina *et al.* (2014) demonstrated that Gram-negative *Salmonella* and *E. coli* were more rapidly inactivated on tomato than Gram-positive *L. monocytogenes* and among the three bacteria studied, *Salmonella* was the most sensitive to ACP.

In contrast, there was no clear pattern of sensitivity between Gram-negative *E. coli* and *Salmonella* isolates inoculated on almonds reported by Niemira *et al.* (2012). The sensitivity of Gram-negative bacteria to ACP treatment was also demonstrated by Niemira *et al.* (2008) where maximal reduction of 3.7 log was obtained after 3 min of treatment *Salmonella* Stanley on apples which was greater than those obtained for *E. coli* (3.4 log CFU/ml). *E. coli* inoculated on radicchio leaves was significantly reduced after 15 min CP treatment, however,

30 min of plasma treatment was necessary to achieve a significant reduction of L. monocytogenes counts (Pasquali et al. 2016). Jayasena et al. (2015) investigated the effect of bacterial cell wall structure on inactivation efficacy of an oxygen/nitrogen plasma generated on flexible thin-layer DBD, and found higher reductions for Gram-negative pathogens. Min et al. (2016) reported higher resistance for Salmonella to in-package DBD ACP treatment as compared to E. coli, L. monocytogenes or Tulane virus (TV) inoculated on lettuce (~6 log CFU/g lettuce). In this work, 5 min of treatment at 34.8 kV resulted in reduction of E. coli, Salmonella, L. monocytogenes, and TV by 1.1, 0.4, 1.0 log CFU/g, and 1.3 log PFU/g, respectively, without modifications of moisture or gas in the packages. Moreover, extended post treatment storage did not induce further reductions in contrast with the previous reports. Some studies report no clear patterns of sensitivity to plasma between Gram-positive and Gram-negative species. Kim et al. (2011) reported effective microbial reduction using helium/oxygen gas mixture for the three pathogenic microorganisms inoculated on bacon. The initial counts (7-8 Log CFU/g) of E. coli, L. monocytogenes, and S. Typhimurium were reduced to 4.80, 5.79, and 6.46 log CFU/g after plasma treatment at 125W for 90 s. Again, increasing the input power and plasma treatment time provided higher inactivation levels for E. coli, L. monocytogenes and S. Typhimurium, regardless of gas composition used for generation of plasma. Likewise, E. coli, L. monocytogenes, and S. Typhimurium counts were each reduced by approximately 2.4 log CFU/ mL following plasma treatment for 10 min.

Cold plasma control of bacterial biofilms

Many human pathogens grow predominantly as biofilms rather than in planktonic mode (Giaouris *et al.* 2013; Sharma *et al.* 2014). Bacterial biofilms are broadly described as a microbially derived sessile community characterized by cells that are attached to a substratum or to each other and are embedded in a matrix of extracellular polymeric substances (EPS), and exhibit an altered phenotype with respect to growth rate and gene transcription (Giaouris

et al. 2013). Formation of bacterial biofilms on food contact surfaces, on food processing equipment and in potable water distribution systems contributes to food spoilage, cross-contamination of food products and spread of foodborne pathogens (Kim and Wei 2012), and therefore represent a major challenge in food industry (Borges *et al.* 2013). Moreover, biofilms are more resistant to various environmental stresses and the actions of applied antimicrobial treatment.

With regard to biofilm susceptibility to the mechanisms of CP, Jahid et al. (2014a) demonstrated that 15 s of ACP treatment reduced planktonic populations of Aeromonas *hydrophila* by $> 5 \log$. However, 5 min of treatment was necessary to significantly reduce bacterial biofilm populations associated with lettuce. Similarly, Salmonella, L. monocytogenes and E. coli suspended in lettuce broth were undetectable after 30 s of in package ACP treatment, however, 5 min of treatment was required to significantly reduce bacterial populations when cells were either attached on the surface or grown as biofilms on lettuce (Ziuzina et al. 2015). Rapid inactivation of Salmonella biofilms attached on glass surface was achieved with plasma jet emitter operating at 1 atm using filtered air as the feed gas. CP reduced biofilms by up to 1.57, 1.82 and 2.13 log CFU/mL after 5, 10 and 15 s of treatment, (Niemira et al. 2014). A submerged or underwater DBD plasma reactor has been used to inactivate biofilms of key food-borne pathogens, such as E. coli, Cronobacter sakazakii and Staphylococcus aureus generated on stainless steel surface with reductions by 5.50, 6.88 and 4.20 log CFU/coupon, respectively, obtained after 90 min of treatment. The ATR-FTIR measurement showed gradual reduction of carbohydrates, proteins, and lipid and DNA peak regions with increased plasma exposure time (Khan et al. 2016). Furthermore, Gabriel et al. (2016) addressed the influence of different surface features on the bacterial attachment and therefore biofilm formation and susceptibility to treatment. Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms were developed on different types of stainless steel, such as 316 and 304

with different finishes namely, mirror, hairline and 2B surfaces. Variations in D-values were observed between surface finishes within a specific stainless steel type. However, significant variations were not observed between the same surface finish of different steel types. A 5-log reduction in the population was observed in a relatively short treatment times of ~ 90 s (Gabriel *et al.* 2016). Although with different range of processing times required to achieve significant inactivation of biofilms of foodborne pathogens, these studies demonstrated that CP could be an alternative technology for effective decontamination of materials within food processing environment.

The major mechanisms for CP mediated biofilm inactivation reported to date are illustrated in **Figure 5** and include alterations in cell membrane integrity, destruction of EPS, cells and cellular components, reduction of biofilm thickness, reduced culturability and metabolic activity of cells. Air DBD ACP treatment for 5 min significantly altered biofilm structures of *E. coli* and *P. aeruginosa* formed on polycarbonate membranes, changing the healthy cells interconnected by self-produced EPS matrices to irregularly shaped cell fragments. This corresponded to >5 log reductions in biofilms developed in 96 well plate model (Ziuzina *et al.* 2014, 2015). Alkawareek *et al.* (2012) demonstrated marked susceptibility of *P. aeruginosa* biofilms in vitro to plasma jet treatment operating in a helium oxygen mixture after minutes of treatment. In this work, confocal scanning laser microscopy (CLSM) demonstrated that vast majority of cells within biofilm of 40 - 80 μ m thickness were nonviable after 3 min of treatment. Pei *et al.* (2012) also reported that plasma generated ROS were able to penetrate to the bottom layer of a 25.5 μ m-thick *Enterococcus faecalis* biofilm and produce a strong bactericidal effect.

These studies indicate the ability of the plasma reactive species to penetrate deeply into the biofilm and inactivate the cells within and / or that secondary reactive products were formed at the biological or liquid interface that mediate an antimicrobial effect. Within 5 min of in

package ACP DBD treatment, *P. aureuginosa* biofilm thickness went from 23 to 6 μ m (Ziuzina *et al.* 2014). Similarly, *Candida albicans* biofilm, with a thickness of 10 to 20 mm, was completely removed within 5 min of argon/oxygen plasma treatment (Fricke *et al.* 2012). Severe damage and etching effect of plasma on *Candida albicans* biofilms were also observed by Koban *et al.* (2010) and Sun *et al.* (2012) whereas effects on biofilms of Grampositive and Gram-negative bacteria were reported by Lee *et al.* (2009).

Research to date proposing anti-biofilm mechanisms of action of CP has often used biofilms developed on abiotic surfaces in response to clinical manifestation or industrial surface biofouling. In the case of biofilm formation on food surfaces, another important factor that has potential to further elevate resistance to antimicrobial agents is the internalisation of bacterial pathogens. Bacterial internalization may occur through entering plant natural openings (e.g. hydathodes, stomata, lenticels) or physically damaged sites during processing and is dependent on time, temperature, light, pressure, produce surface characteristics and the native endophytic microbial community (Kroupitski et al. 2009; Golberg et al. 2011; Deering et al. 2012; Gu et al. 2013a, b; O'Beirne et al. 2014). In a comparative study of several decontamination approaches, 200 ppm chlorine, 2% citric, lactic, or malic acids, 32 Hz ultrasonication, 390 mJ/cm² ultraviolet-C, and 750 mJ/cm² cold oxygen plasma were compared for the reduction of *L. monocytogenes* biofilms formed on lettuce and cabbage surfaces. The highest reduction was achieved using ACP regardless of the produce used. This further suggests that plasma reactive species could penetrate or degrade the biofilm matrix, leading to cell inactivation (Srey et al. 2014). However, cells that had internalized into vegetable stomata could not be reached. Fernandez et al. (2013) also suggested that vegetable stomata and convolutions on the product surface can play a significant role in protecting microbial cells from the action of ACP generated reactive species. The antimicrobial potential of inpackage ACP treatment with subsequent 24 h of storage was demonstrated as an effective

approach for inactivating *Salmonella*, *L. monocytogenes* and *E. coli* biofilms formed on lettuce (Ziuzina *et al.* 2015). Moreover, plasma treatment was challenged with bacteria internalised in lettuce tissue and SEM analyses showed that cold plasma treatment in conjunction with 24 h of post treatment storage had detrimental effects on surface attached cells. However, high remaining concentrations of cells were noted inside the stomata. Jahid *et al.* (2015) also reported increased resistance of *Salmonella* Typhimurium bacterial biofilms on lettuce leaves to plasma due to internalization and extensive colonization in produce stomata wells. These findings highlight the advantages of in package treatment design, which mitigates against recontamination or cross contamination events by surviving microorganisms protected by biofilms and/or within complex structures.

In response to the diversity of microbiological challenges, the forms they can take and antimicrobial resistance, CP devices and approaches are being developed which may be dry or liquid mediated. There is a need for standardised surface-food-microbial systems to facilitate adequate comparison of antimicrobial efficacy of different CP systems. Moreover, because a majority of persistent bacterial infections are associated with biofilms, biofilm resistance towards antimicrobial treatments, including plasma treatment, should form part of the studies where antimicrobial effect of novel decontamination technology is investigated.

Clinical applications of cold plasma

The past two decades have witnessed a rapid expansion in the potential applications of CP to controlling infection within the clinical setting. Primarily, these studies have been aimed at controlling bacterial pathogens, but CP exposure has been shown to rapidly and effectively inactivate a wide range of infectious agents. In particular, the ability of plasma to eradicate bacterial biofilms efficiently has been demonstrated by a number of groups. Biofilms represent a particular challenge in the healthcare setting, since they exhibit highly elevated tolerance to antimicrobial challenge (Olson *et al.* 2002 Ceri *et al.* 2010), are implicated in

medical device- and health care associated infections (Revdiwala et al., 2012) and act as reservoirs of infection in the environment (Hall-Stoodley and Stoodley, 2009). Biofilms also represent a major virulence characteristic in acute and chronic infections, where they are the predominant mode of growth (Wolcott and Erlich 2008). Recently, ACP has also been shown to rapidly inactivate biofilms of antibiotic resistant bacteria such as the so-called ESKAPE pathogens (Flynn et al. 2015) and Burkholderia cenocepacia (Alshraiedeh et al. 2016), however the effects of plasma can be highly variable, with biomass and catalase production playing significant roles mediating biofilm tolerance to plasma exposure. ACP exposure has also been shown, for the first time, to induce formation of plasma-resistant persister cells in Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms (Mai-Prochnow et al. 2015), attributed to the production of the redox-active antibiotic pigment, phenazine. Whilst the above studies indicate an ability of bacteria, particularly in the biofilm mode of growth, to develop tolerance to plasma exposure, a number of studies have focused specifically on the effects of plasma interaction with antibiotic resistant bacteria. Bayliss and co-workers described the restoration of antibiotic sensitivity in MRSA following cold plasma exposure, and suggest the possibility of combined treatment with plasma exposure and conventional antibiotics as a mechanism to reinstate sensitivity to and circumvent antibiotic resistance (Bayliss et al. 2013). Plasma exposure appears to lead to rapid disinfection of multidrug resistant bacterial via induction of cell surface damage, indicating a physical mechanism of bactericidal activity (Kvam et al. 2012). Recently, cold atmospheric plasma treatment has been shown to eradicate both vancomycin resistant enterococci (VRE) and high level gentamicin resistant (HLGR) enterococci, however efficacy was dependent on degree of resistance and membership of special resistance groups of clinical-outbreak importance (Napp et al. 2016).

Control of quorum sensing-mediated virulence

Although the mechanism of action of plasmas vary according to the unique chemical

environment created by different types of plasma generation device, and whilst the precise mechanism of action is still not completely understood in each case, a number of cellular targets have been identified which interact with plasma components and lead to loss of cell viability (Alkawareek et al. 2014). Despite this, the interactions of cold plasma with molecular components of cell signalling pathways and their downstream virulence factors has only recently been described. Quorum sensing is a cell density-dependent cell-cell signaling mechanism employed by bacteria to regulate group behaviours at a community level, including biofilm formation, antimicrobial tolerance and resistance and virulence (Williams 2007). The first demonstration of the ability of plasma to interfere with quorum sensingcontrolled virulence factors, by Ziuzina and co-workers (2015), such as pyocyanin and elastase (lasB) described a high voltage DBD ACP with samples treated 'in pack'. Following short exposures, pyocyanin production was significantly inhibited and lasB activity reduced after 300 seconds exposure. Supporting these observations, Flynn and colleagues demonstrated the ability of plasma exposures to directly disrupt quorum sensing molecules utilized by Gram negative bacteria, the acylhomoserine lactones (AHLs), and reduce downstream bioluminescence and pigment production in reporter strains and significantly reduced production of pycyanin and pyoverdin, reducing virulence of *P. aeruginosa* in an in vivo model (Flynn et al. 2016). The ability to modulate bacterial virulence with short exposures opens the potential for cold plasma treatments to be employed in an anti-virulence, rather than an antimicrobial/bactericidal, context which may reduce the likelihood of resistance development.

Cold plasma and sporicidal activity

Bacterial endospores (or spores), dormant structures formed by members of the Genera *Bacillus* and *Clostridium*, exhibit highly elevated tolerance to environmental stresses, allowing them to survive for prolonged periods in a dormant state (Kennedy 1994; Leggett *et*

al. 2012). Evolutionary adaptations, which facilitate long-term dormancy in the environment also impart significant resistance to disinfectants, chemical sterilants, thermal inactivation and desiccation (Setlow 2006; Leggett et al. 2012). Bacterial spores therefore pose particular challenges in the food industry, pharmaceutical manufacturing environments and healthcare settings, where they represent persistent sources of product contamination. The mechanisms of intrinsic resistance to chemical disinfectants/sterilants are primarily due to their impermeable outer layers and low water content (Leggett et al. 2016) and, given the production of a highly oxidizing environment produced by cold plasmas, similar to oxidizing disinfectants like sodium hypochlorite, hydrogen peroxide and peracetic acid, similar resistance profiles are observed when assessing the sporicidal effects of plasma exposure. Amongst the first reports of spore inactivation by atmospheric pressure, cold plasma described the inactivation of endospores of Bacillus steaothermophilus and Bacillus subtilis on solid surfaces, fabrics, filter paper and powder culture media using One Atmosphere Uniform Glow Discharge Plasma (OAUGDP) device at room temperature (Kelly-Wintenberg et al. 1998). The authors reported variable sensitivity to plasma exposures, with seven minute exposures reducing B. stearothermophilus by $\geq 3 \log_{10}$ reductions in CFU, whilst 5 minutes exposure reduced *B. subtilis* viable spore counts by $\geq 5 \log_{10}$ reductions in CFU.

Van Bokhorst-van de Veen *et al.* (2014) tested nitrogen plasma biocidal activity against *Bacillus cereus, Bacillus atrophaeus* and *G. stearothermophilus* spores and compared ACP efficacy to heat, hypochlorite, hydrogen peroxide, and UV treatment. Plasma treatment of 20 min reduced spores of *B. cereus, G. stearothermophilus*, and *B. atrophaeus* by 3.7, 4.2, and 4.9 log units respectively. Spores of different bacteria varied in their degree of inactivation by applied heat, hypochlorite, hydrogen peroxide, and UV treatments, whereas similar inactivation results were obtained for spores treated with ACP. Distinct morphological changes included the appearance of rough spore surfaces from the etching action of ACP

treatment. Lee and co-workers also described the sporocidal activity of a helium/oxygen ACP system. Their data indicated that the sterilizing effects of their plasma system was due to reactive oxygen radicals and not UV, and reported a D-value of 14 minutes which was not correlated to initial spore density (Lee *et al.* 2006).

Recently, the application of a high voltage ($70kV_{RMS}$) DBD ACP system to inactivation of Bacillus atrophaeus within a sealed package was described. Rapid direct and indirect (inpackage) sporocidal activity was demonstrated, with 60s exposures bringing about reductions of $\geq 6 \log_{10}$ reductions (direct) and 2.1 or 6.3 \log_{10} reduction of spore viability, depending on gas types used for plasma generation. Sporicidal activity was critically influenced by relative humidity and plasma-generated reactive species other than ozone were found to be critical to inactivation efficiency (Patil et al. 2014). The sporicidal activity of nitrogen ACP is not based on UV-C radiation only. To distinguish between lethal effects of emitted UV-light and reactive species, Reineke et al. (2015) exposed UV-sensitive mutant spore strains of B. subtilis to jet argon plasmas with different UV emission intensities and a significant impact of UV-light on the first phase of spore inactivation was confirmed. The sporicidal effects of pure argon plasma were comparable with high UV emission plasma against B. atrophaeus and B. subtilis spores, confirming that spore inactivation is dominated by the action of UV photons if the UV intensity is high enough. Cold plasmas generated in air have demonstrated efficacy against *Clostridium difficile* spores on hospital surfaces (vapor permeable mattress sections and stainless steel) (Claro et al. 2015).

Schnabel *et al.* (2012) evaluated plasma treatment of *B. atrophaeus* spores inoculated on different seeds. The surface structure of investigated seeds played an important role in sporicidal action of ACP. Depending on seed surface characteristics, 15 min of treatment reduced the number of spores by > 6 log units. Hertwig *et al.* (2015) reported reductions by 2.4 and 2.8 log for *B. subtilis* and *B. atrophaeus* spores inoculated on whole black pepper,

respectively, after 30 min of exposure to plasma afterglow and by 0.8 and 1.3 log, respectively, after 15 min exposure to direct plasma jet treatment. SEM analysis demonstrated modification of the external shape of spores, which was attributed to the decomposition of organic material by etching and photo-desorption, which are associated with chemical bond breakage leading to the formation of volatile compounds. Butscher et al (2015) employed a low-pressure fluidized bed plasma reactor for decontamination of *B. amyloliquefaciens* on wheat grains with > 2 log units reductions in 30s at power input of 900 W. Spore elimination required an hour of plasma treatment which raised the surface temperature of grains to 90°C. Butscher *et al.* (2016) later reported the influence of substrate shape and surface properties on efficacy of atmospheric pressure DBD-generated pulsed plasma inactivation of *Geobacillus stearothermophilus*. While 10 min of treatment yielded \sim 5 log reductions on polypropylene granules, the maximum spore inactivation on wheat grains was 3 log units after 60 min of treatment. Thus, there are considerable gaps in knowledge for rapid plasma control of spores within biological matrices, that do not compromise other desirable or essential elements of that matrix.

Virucidal activity of cold plasma

Cold plasmas have shown significant promise in replacing conventional disinfectant approaches for the inactivation of viruses. Initially, CP was shown to rapidly inactivate bacteriophages, often employed as a facile surrogate model for evaluating the virucidal activity of chemical disinfectants against human, animal and plant pathogenic viruses (Alshraiedeh *et al.* 2013). Venezia and colleagues described the antimicrobial activity of a commercially available system (PlasmaSol apparatus) against a range of bacteria, spores and viruses. The authors report 4-6 log10 reductions in PFU ml⁻¹ of temperate and lytic bacteriophages after 10 minutes exposure (Venezia *et al.* 2008). Interestingly, a separate study examining the virucidal activity of a novel dielectric barrier discharge reactor, Yasuda

and co-workers reported rapid inactivation of lambda phage infectivity by up to 6 log10 reductions after only 20 seconds (Yasuda et al. 2010). The E. coli MS2 bacteriophage has been validated as a convenient, representative surrogate for human norovirus in establishing the virucidal activity of biocides in chemical disinfectant efficacy tests (Maillard *et al.* 1994; Pinto et al. 2010). Alshraiedeh and colleagues reported the virucidal efficacy of a handheld, helium/oxygen, KHz driven atmospheric pressure non thermal plasma jet (described in Alkawareek et al. 2012) against MS2 bacteriophage. MS2 bacteriophage was rapidly inactivated, with inactivation rate constant increasing with increasing oxygen percentages in the feed gas, up to 0.75%. Up to 3 \log_{10} reductions in PFU ml⁻¹ were recorded after 3 seconds, with > 7 \log_{10} reductions in PFU ml⁻¹ after 9 minutes exposure (Alshraiedeh *et al.* 2013). A cold oxygen plasma, described by Terrier et al. (2009) was also shown to efficiently inactivate nebulized respiratory viruses human parainfluenza virus 3 (hPIV-3), respiratory syncytial virus (RSV) and influenza virus A (H5N2), reducing the titre of each by up to 6.5, 3.8 and 4 log10 TCID50 ml-1, respectively, within the allocated treatment time. The ability of CP to inactivate norovirus (foodborne outbreak strain) in faecal samples has recently been demonstrated (Ahlfeld et al. 2015). Such field testing of virucidal activity of CP in clinical samples supports the potential application of CP systems to efficiently disinfect virally contaminated surfaces and fomites, reducing the potential risk of onward transmission of infectious agents.

Anti-protozoal activity of cold plasma

Whilst the antimicrobial efficacy of CP is now well established in terms of antibacterial, antifungal, antiviral and sporocidal activity, the anti-protozoal activity has received relatively little attention. However, studies are emerging which indicate that CP exposure yields moderate reductions in protozoal viability. Recently, a pulsed-gas plasma-discharge (PPGD) system was evaluated for its ability to inactivate the enteric protozoal pathogen

Cryptosporidium parvum, a common cause of water-borne disease (cryptosporidiosis) in humans (Hunter & Syed, 2001). The environmentally stable oocysts exhibit resistance to chemical disinfectants, such as chlorine, hypochlorus acid and ozone (Pereira et al. 2008; Rowan 2011). Therefore, alternative methods for decontamination of waste and drinking water are urgently required. Hayes et al. (2013) report for the first time the inactivation of C. parvum oocytes by pulsed electric discharges into gas injected liquids, which results in generation of ozone, hydrogen peroxide and UV light. In this study a 4 log_{10} reduction in C. parvum oocyte viability was achieved after 32 minutes of PPGD exposure (Hayes et al. 2013). Heaselgrave and co-workers also reported the inactivation of trophozites and cysts of the protozoan Acanthamoeba polyphagia and Acanthamoeba castellannii using ACP generating apparatus (ambient air plasma). Acanthamoeba spp. are ocular pathogens which are etiological agents of Acanthamoeba keratitis (AK), a potentially sight limiting corneal infection, sometimes associated with contact lens use (Lorenzo-Morales et al. 2015). Trophozites of A. polyphagia and A. castellannii were highly susceptible to plasma inactivation, exhibiting complete inactivation after 1 and 2 minutes exposure, respectively. Furthermore, for the more disinfectant resistant cyst stage of both species, 4-minute exposures led to complete inactivation (Heaselgrave et al. 2016). These studies indicate that, whilst variations in inactivation efficiency for protozoa depend on plasma generating system parameters and test protozoan/life cycle stage, CP may have promise in controlling protozoal infections and contamination across a broad range of applications.

Concluding comments and future directions

There are recent advances, which further the understanding of the antimicrobial mechanisms of CP generated reactive species across the range of microbiological challenges. These mechanistic insights can drive successful adoption of CP technology. There is strong potential for CP to address some of the most critical issues including antimicrobial resistance

and sustainability. The range of mechanisms of action in addition to the possibility of synergistic action with known biocidal or anti-biotic agents suggests there is scope to enhance activity against resistant strains, or even reinstate antibiotic sensitivity. The diversity of application devices and technologies available allows flexibility in application although comparisons can be difficult to make. The liquid mediated effects of CP generated reactive species, which are linked to the stable secondary forms of the reactive species are chemically and biochemically quantifiable, opening up avenues for quantifiable dosage regimens. The flexibility of adoption for safety as well as spoilage concerns drives research associated with foods using plasma processed air or liquids where the efficacy required to comply with microbiological criteria for sensitive foods can be attained. From a contamination control perspective, a unique advantage can be offered with in package generation of plasma reactive species, as this approach mitigates post processing contamination and cross contamination events. However, it is important that the demonstrated efficacy is considered in tandem with establishing the human and environmental safety of the approach to drive regulatory acceptance and compliance.

Acknowledgements: Science Foundation Ireland Grant No 14/IA/2626

Conflict of interest: There is no conflict of interest to declare

References

- Ahlfeld, B., Li, Y., Boulaaba, A., Binder, A., Schotte, U., Zimmerman, J.L., Morfill, G., Klein, G. (2015) Inactivation of a foodborne norovirus outbreak strain with nonthermal atmospheric pressure plasma. mBio 6; e020300-14.
- Alkawareek, M.Y., Algwari, Q.T., Laverty, G., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G., O'Connell, D., Gilmore, B.F. (2012) Eradication of Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms by atmospheric pressure non-thermal plasma. PLoS One 7, e44289.
- Alkawareek, M.Y., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G. and Gilmore, B.F. (2014) Potential cellular targets and antibacterial efficacy of atmospheric pressure non-thermal plasma. Int J. Antimicrob. Agents, 43, 154–160.
- Alshraiedeh, N.H., Alkawareek, M.Y., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G., Gilmore, B.F. (2013) Atmospheric pressure, nonthermal plasma inactivation of MS2 bacteriophage: effect of

oxygen concentration on virucidal activity. J. Appl. Microbiol 115, 1420-1426.

- Alshraiedeh, N.H., Higginbotham, S., Flynn, P.B., Alkawareek, M.Y., Tunney, M.M., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G., Gilmore, B.F. (2016) Eradication and phenotypic tolerance of Burkholderia cenocepacia biofilms exposed to atmospheric pressure non-thermal plasma. Int. J. Antimicrob. Agents, 47, 446-450.
- Baier, M. et al., 2015. Inactivation of Shiga toxin-producing Escherichia coli O104 : H4 using cold atmospheric pressure plasma. J. Biosci. Bioeng, 120(3), 275–279.
- Banu, M.S., Sasikala, P., Kavitha, V. and Rajamani, L. (2012) Cold plasma as a novel food processing technology. IJETED, 2, 803 818.
- Bayliss, D.L., Shama, G. and Kong, M.G. (2013) Restoration of antibiotic sensitivity in meticillin-resistant Staphylococcus aureus following treatment with a non-thermal atmospheric gas plasma. Int. J. Antimicrob. Agents, 41, 393-401.
- Bermúdez-Aguirre, D., Wemlinger, E., Pedrow, P., Barbosa-Cánovas, G. and Garcia-Perez, M. (2013) Effect of atmospheric pressure cold plasma (APCP) on the inactivation of Escherichia coli in fresh produce. Food Control, 34, 149-157.
- Borges, A., Simões, L.C., Saavedra, M.J., Simõe, M. (2013) The action of selected isothiocyanates on bacterial biofilm prevention and control. Int. Biodeterior Biodegradation, 86, 25-33.
- Butscher, D. et al., (2015) Inactivation of microorganisms on granular materials: Reduction of Bacillus amyloliquefaciens endospores on wheat grains in a low pressure plasma circulating fluidized bed reactor. J. Food Eng, 159, 48–56.
- Butscher, D., Loon, H. Van, et al., (2016) International Journal of Food Microbiology Plasma inactivation of microorganisms on sprout seeds in a dielectric barrier discharge. Int. J. Food Microbiol, 238, 222–232.
- Butscher, D., Zimmermann, D., et al., (2016) Plasma inactivation of bacterial endospores on wheat grains and polymeric model substrates in a dielectric barrier discharge. Food Control, 60, 636–645.
- Ceri, H., Olson, M.E. and Turner, R.J. (2010) Needed, new paradigms in antibiotic development. Expert Opin Pharmacother 11, 1233-1237.
- Claro, T., Cahill, O.J., O'Connor, N., Daniels, S., Humphreys, H. (2015) Cold-air atmospheric pressure plasma against Clostridium difficile spores: A potential alternative for the decontamination of hospital inanimate surfaces. Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol 36, 742-744.
- Critzer, M., Kelly-Wintenberg, K., South, S. and Golden, D. (2007) Atmospheric plasma inactivation of foodborne pathogens on fresh produce surfaces. J. Food Prot, 70, 2290.
- Deering, A.J., Mauer, L.J. and Pruitt, R.E. (2012) Internalization of *E. coli* O157:H7 and *Salmonella* spp. in plants: A review. Food Res. Int, 45, 567–575.
- Dobrynin, D., Fridman, D., Friedman, G. and Fridman, A. (2009) Physical and biological mechanisms of direct plasma interaction with living tissue. New J. Phys, 11, 1 26.

EFSA (2015). Scientific report of EFSA and ECDC. The European Union summary report on trends and sources of zoonoses, zoonotic agents and food-borne outbreaks in 2013. EFSA Journal, 13(1), 399.1

- Ehlbeck, J., Schnabel, U., Polak, M., Winter, J. von Woedtke, T., Brandenburg, R., von dem Hagen, T. and Weltmann, K.D. (2011) Low Temperature Atmospheric Pressure Plasma Sources for Microbial Decontamination. J. Phys. D: Appl. Phys, 44.
- Ermolaeva, S.A., Varfolomeev, A.F., Chernukha, M. Yu., Yurov, D.S., Vasiliev, M.M., Kaminskaya, A.A., Moisenovich, M.M., Romanova, J.M., Murashev, A.N., Selezneva, I.I., Shimizu, T., Sysolyatina, E.V., Shaginyan, I.A., Petrov, O.F., Mayevsky, E.I., Fortov, V.E., Morfill, G.E., Naroditsky, B.S. and Gintsburg, A.L. (2011) Bactericidal effects of

non-thermal argon plasma in vitro, in biofilms and in the animal model of infected wounds. J. Med. Microbiol, 60, 75–83.

- Fernández, A., Noriega, E. & Thompson, A., (2013) Inactivation of Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium on fresh produce by cold atmospheric gas plasma technology. Food Microbiol, 33(1), pp.24–29.
- Fernandez, A., Noriega, E. and Thompson, A. (2013) Inactivation of *Salmonella enterica* serovar Typhimurium on fresh produce by cold atmospheric gas plasma technology. Food Microbiol, 33, 24 9.
- Flynn, P.B., Busetti, A., Wielogorska, E., Chevallier, O.P., Elliott, C.T., Laverty, G., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G., Gilmore, B.F. (2016) Potential cellular targets and antibacterial efficacy of atmospheric pressure non-thermal plasma. Sci Rep 6, 26320.
- Flynn, P.B., Higginbotham, S., Alshraiedeh, N., Gorman, S.P., Graham, W.G., Gilmore B.F. (2015) Bactericidal efficacy of atmospheric pressure non-thermal plasma (APNTP) against the ESKAPE pathogens. Int J Antimicrob Agents 46, 101-107.
- Fricke, K., Koban, I., Tresp, H., Jablonowski, L., Schroder, K., Kramer, A., Weltmann, K.D., von Woedtke, T. and Kocher, T. (2012) Atmospheric Pressure Plasma: A High-Performance Tool for the Efficient Removal of Biofilms. PLoS ONE, 7(8): e42539. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0042539.
- Fridman, G., Brooks, A.D., Balasubramanian, M., Fridman, A., Gutsol, A., Vasilets, V.N., Ayan, H. and Friedman, G. (2007) Comparison of direct and indirect effects of nonthermal atmospheric- pressure plasma on bacteria. Plasma Process Polym 4, 370-375.
- Gabriel, A.A., Ugay, M., Siringan M.A.T., Rosario, L.M.D., Tumlos, R.B., Ramos, H.J. (2016). Atmospheric pressure plasma jet inactivation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms on stainless steel surfaces. IFSET, 36, 311–319.
- Gallagher, M.J. Jr, Vaze, N., Gangoli, S., Vasilets, V.N., Gutsol, A.F., Milovanova, T.N., Anandan, S., Murasko, D.M. and Fridman, A.A. (2007) Rapid Inactivation of Airborne Bacteria Using Atmospheric Pressure Dielectric Barrier Grating Discharge. IEEE T Plasma Sci, 35, 1501-1510.
- Giaouris, E., Heir, E., Hébraud, M., Chorianopoulos, N., Langsrud, S., Møretrø, T., Habimana, O., Desvaux, M., Renier, S. and Nychas, G.J. (2013) Attachment and biofilm formation by foodborne bacteria in meat processing environments: Causes, implications, role of bacterial interactions and control by alternative novel methods. Meat Sci, 97, 298– 309.
- Golberg, D., Kroupitski, Y., Belausov, E., Pinto, R. and Sela, S. (2011) *Salmonella* Typhimurium internalization is variable in leafy vegetables and fresh herbs. Int. J. Food Microbiol, 145, 250–257.
- Graves, D. (2014). Oxy-Nitroso shielding burst model of cold atmospheric plasma therapeutics. Clinical Plasma Medicine, 2, 38-49.
- Gu, G., Cevallos-Cevallos, J.M., Vallad, G.E. and van Bruggen, A.H.C. (2013a). Organically managed soils reduce internal colonization of tomato plants by Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium. J. Phytopathol, 103, 381 388.
- Gu, G., Cevallos-Cevallos, J.M. and van Bruggen, A.H.C. (2013b). Ingress of Salmonella enterica Typhimurium into tomato leaves through hydathodes. *PLoS ONE*, 8(1): e53470. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0053470.
- Gurol, C. et al., (2012) International Journal of Food Microbiology Low Temperature Plasma for decontamination of E. coli in milk. Int. J. Food Microbiol, 157(1), 1–5.
- Hall-Stoodley, L. and Stoodley, P. (2009) Evolving concepts in biofilm infections. Cell Microbiol 11, 1034-43.
- Han, L., Patil, S., Boehm, D., Milosavljević, V., Cullen, P.J. and Bourke, P. (2015) Mechanism of Inactivation by High Voltage Atmospheric Cold Plasma Differs between

Escherichia coli and Staphylococcus aureus. Applied and Environmental Microbiology, AEM. 02660-02615.

- Hayes, J., Kirf, D., Garvey, M., Rowan, N. (2013) Disinfection and toxicological assessments of pulsed UV and pulsed-plasma gas-discharge treated water containing the waterborne protozoan enteroparasite Cryptosporidium parvum. J Microbiol Methods 94, 325-337.
- Heaselgrave, W., Shama, G., Andrew, P.W., Kong, M.G. (2016) Inactivation of Acanthamoeba spp. and other ocular pathogens by application of cold atmospheric gas plasma. Appl Environ Microbiol 82, 3143-3148.
- Hertwig, C., Reineke, K., Ehlbeck, J., Knorr, D., Schlüter, O. (2015) Decontamination of whole black pepper using different cold atmospheric pressure plasma applications. Food Control, 55, 221 - 229.
- Hunter, P.R. and Syed, Q. (2001) Community surveys of self-reported diarrhoea can dramatically overestimate the size of outbreaks of waterborne cryptosporidiosis. Water Sci Technol 43, 27-30.
- Jahid, I.K., Han, N. and Ha, S.D. (2014) Inactivation kinetics of cold oxygen plasma depend on incubation conditions of Aeromonas hydrophila biofilm on lettuce. Food Res. Int, 55, 181–189.
- Jahid, I.K., Han, N., Zhang, C.Y. and Ha, S.D. (2015) Mixed culture biofilms of Salmonella Typhimurium and cultivable indigenous microorganisms on lettuce show enhanced resistance of their sessile cells to cold oxygen plasma. Food Microbiol, 46, 383 – 394.
- Jayasena, D.D. et al., (2015) Flexible thin-layer dielectric barrier discharge plasma treatment of pork butt and beef loin : Effects on pathogen inactivation and meat-quality attributes. Food Microbiol, 46, 51–57.
- Jeyaletchumi, P., Tunung, R., Margaret, S.P., Son, R., Farinazleen, M.G. and Cheah, Y.K. (2010) Review Article. Detection of *Listeria monocytogenes* in foods. Int Food Res J, 17, 1-11.
- Joshi, S.G., Cooper, M., Yost, A., Paff, M., Ercan, U.K., Fridman, G., Fridman, G., Fridman, A. and Brooks, A.D. (2011) Nonthermal dielectric-barrier discharge plasma-induced inactivation involves oxidative DNA damage and membrane lipid peroxidation in *Escherichia coli*. Antimicrob Agents Chemother, 55, 1053 1062.
- Kelly-Witenberg, K., Montie, T.C., Brickman, C., Roth, J.R., Carr, A.K., Sorge, K., Wadsworth, L.C., Tsai, P.P. (1998) J Ind Microbiol Biotechnol 20, 69-74.
- Kennedy, M.J. (1994) Preservation records of microorganisms evidence of the tenacity of life. Microbiology 140, 2513-2529.
- Khan, M.S.I., Lee, E.J. and Kim Y.J. (2016). A submerged dielectric barrier discharge plasma inactivation mechanism of biofilms produced by Escherichia coli O157:H7, Cronobacter sakazakii, and Staphylococcus aureus. Sci Reports, 6:37072, DOI: 10.1038/srep37072
- Kim, B. et al., (2011) Effect of atmospheric pressure plasma on inactivation of pathogens inoculated onto bacon using two different gas compositions. Food Microbiol, 28(1), 9–13.
- Kim, H. et al., (2013) Effect of Inactivating Salmonella Typhimurium in Raw Chicken Breast and Pork Loin Using an Atmospheric Pressure Plasma Jet. Journal of Animal Science and Technology, 55(6), 545–549.
- Kim, S.H. and Wei, C. (2012) Biofilms. In Decontamination of Fresh and Minimally Processed Produce. Ed. Gomez-Lopez, V. M., Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, USA, 59-71.
- Klockow, P.A. and Keener, K.M. (2009) Safety and quality assessment of packaged spinach treated with a novel ozone-generation system. LWT Food Sci. Technol, 42, 1047–1053.
- Koban, I. et al., 2010. Treatment of Candida albicans biofilms with low-temperature plasma induced by dielectric barrier discharge and atmospheric pressure plasma jet. New J. Phys, 12, 1-16.
- Kroupitski, Y., Golberg, d., Belausov, E., Pinto, R., Swartzberg, D., Granot, D. and Sela, S.

(2009). Internalization of *Salmonella enterica* in leaves is induced by light and involves chemotaxis and penetration through open stomata. Appl. Environ. Microbiol, 75, 6076–6086.

- Kvam, E., Davis, B., Mondello, F., Garner, A.L. (2012) Non-thermal atmospheric plasma rapidly disinfects multidrug-resistant microbes by inducing cell surface damage. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 56, 2028-2036.
- Laroussi, M. (2009) Low-temperature plasmas for medicine? Plasma Science, IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci, 37, 714-725.
- Laroussi, M., Mendis, D.A. and Rosenberg, M. (2003) Plasma interaction with microbes. New J Phys 5, 41.41-41.10.
- Lee, K., Paek, K.-H., Ju, W.-T., Lee, Y. (2006) Sterilization of bacteria, yeast, and bacterial endospores by atmospheric-pressure cold plasma using helium and oxygen. J Microbiol 44, 269-275.
- Lee, M.H. et al., (2009) Removal and sterilization of biofilms and planktonic bacteria by microwave-induced argon plasma at atmospheric pressure. New J. Phys, 11, 1 11.
- Legget, M.J., Setlow, P., Sattar, S.A., Maillard, J.-Y. (2016) Assessing the activity of microbiocides against bacterial spores: knowledge and pitfalls. J Appl Microbiol 120, 1174-1180.
- Leggett, M.J., McDonnell, G., Denyer, S.P., Setlow, P., Maillard, J.-Y. (2012) Bacterial spore structures and their protective role in biocide resistance. J Appl Microbiol 113,485-498.
- Lorenzo-Morales, J., Khan, N.A., Walochink, J. (2015) An update on Acanthamoeba keratitis: diagnosis, pathogenesis and treatment. Parasite 22, 10.
- Maillard, J.-Y., Beggs, T.S., Day, M.J., Hudson, R.A., Russell, A.D. (1994) Effect of biocides on MS2 and K coliphages. Appl Environ Microbiol 60, 2205-2206.
- Mai-Prochnow, A., Bradbury, M., Ostrikov, K., Murphy, A.B. (2015) Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilm response and resistance to cold atmospheric pressure plasma is linked to the redox-active molecule phenazine. PLoS One 10, e0130373.
- Mendis, D., Rosenberg, M. and Azam, F. (2000) A note on the possible electrostatic disruption of bacteria. IEEE Trans Plasma Sci 28, 1304-1306.
- Min, S.C. et al., (2016) International Journal of Food Microbiology Dielectric barrier discharge atmospheric cold plasma inhibits Escherichia coli O157: H7, Salmonella, Listeria monocytogenes and Tulane virus in Romaine lettuce. Int. J. Food Microbiol, 237, 114–120.
- Misra, N. et al., (2011) Nonthermal Plasma Inactivation of Food-Borne Pathogens. Food Eng. Rev, 3, 159 170.
- Mok, C. and Song, D.M., (2013) Low-pressure discharge plasma inactivation of Salmonella Typhimurium and sanitation of egg. Food Eng. Prog. 17, 245–250.
- Moreau, M., Orange, N. and Feuilloley, M. G. J. (2008) Non-thermal plasma technologies: New tools for bio-decontamination. Biotechnol. Adv, 26, 610 617.
- Napp, M., von Podewils, S., Klare, L., Haase, H., Kasch, R., Gumbel, D., Ekkernkamp, A., Junger, M. (2016) Does antibiotic resistance impair plasma susceptibility of multi-drug resistant clinical isolates of enterococci in vitro. Gut Pathog 1, 41.
- Nehra, V., Kumar, A. and Dwivedi, H.K. (2008) Atmospheric Non-Thermal Plasma Sources. Int. J. Eng, 2, 53 – 68.
- Niemira, B.A. and Sites, J. (2008) Cold plasma inactivates Salmonella Stanley and Escherichia coli O157:H7 inoculated on golden delicious apples. J. Food Prot. 71, 1357-1365.
- Niemira, B.A. (2012) Cold Plasma Reduction of Salmonella and Escherichia coli O157 : H7 on Almonds Using Ambient Pressure Gases. J. Food Sci, 77(3), 171–175.
- Noriega, E. et al., (2011) Cold atmospheric gas plasma disinfection of chicken meat and

chicken skin contaminated with Listeria innocua. Food Microbiol, 28(7), 1293–1300.

- Niemira, B.A., Boyd, G. and Sites, J. (2014). Cold Plasma Rapid Decontamination of Food Contact Surfaces Contaminated with Salmonella Biofilms. J. Food Sci, 79(5), doi: 10.1111/1750-3841.12379
- O'Beirne, D., Gleeson, E., Auty, M. and Jordan, K. (2014) Effects of processing and storage variables on penetration and survival of Escherichia coli O157:H7 in fresh-cut packaged carrots. Food Control, 40, 71 77.
- Olaimat, A.N. and Holley R.A. (2012) Factors influencing the microbial safety of fresh produce: A review. Food Microbiol, 32, 1 19.
- Olson, M.E., Ceri, H., Morck, D.W., Buret, A.G., Read, R.R. (2002) Biofilm bacteria: formation and comparative susceptibility to antibiotics. Can J Vet Res 66, 86-92
- Pasquali, F. et al., (2016) Atmospheric cold plasma process for vegetable leaf decontamination: A feasibility study on radicchio (red chicory, Cichorium intybus L). Food Control, 60, 552–559.
- Patil, S., Moiseev, T., Misra, N.N., Cullen, P.J., Mosnier, J.P., Keener, K.M. and Bourke, P. (2014) Influence of high voltage atmospheric cold plasma process parameters and role of relative humidity on inactivation of Bacillus atrophaeus spres inside a sealed package. J Hosp Infect 88, 162-169.
- Pei, X., Lu, X., Liu, J., Liu, D., Yang, Y., Ostrikov, K., Chu, P.K. and Pan, Y. (2012) Inactivation of a 25.5 μm *Enterococcus faecalis* biofilm by a room-temperature, batteryoperated, handheld air plasma jet. J. Phys. D: Appl. Phys, 45, 1 – 5.
- Pereira, J.T., Costa, A.O., de Oliveira Silva, M.B., Schuchard, W., Osaki, S.C., de Castro, E.A., Paulino, R.C., Soccol, V.T. (2008) Comparing the efficacy of chlorine, chlorine dioxide, and ozone in the inactivation of Cryptosporidium parvum in water from Parana State, Southern Brazil. Appl Biochem Biotechnol 151, 464-473.
- Pinto, F., Maillard, J.-Y. and Denyer, S.P. (2010) Effect of surfactants, temperature, and sonication on the virucidal activity of polyhexamethylene biguanide against the bacteriophage MS2. Am J Infect Control 38, 393-398.
- Ragni, L. et al., (2010) Non-thermal atmospheric gas plasma device for surface decontamination of shell eggs. J. Food Eng. 100(1), 125–132.
- Raybaudi-Massilia, R.M., Mosqueda-Melgar, J., Soliva-Fortuny, R. and Martin-Belloso, O. (2009) Control of Pathogenic and Spoilage Microorganisms in Fresh-cut Fruits and Fruit Juices by Traditional and Alternative Natural Antimicrobials. Compr. Rev. Food Sci. Food Saf, 8, 157 – 180.
- Reineke, K. et al., (2015) The impact of different process gas compositions on the inactivation effect of an atmospheric pressure plasma jet on Bacillus spores. Innov. food sci. and emerg. technol., 30, 112–118.
- Revdiwala S, Rajdev BM, Mulla S. (2012) Characterization of bacterial etiologic agents of biofilm formation in medical devices in critical care setup. Crit Care Res Pract 2012; 2012: 945805.
- Rod, S. K., Hansen, F., Leipold, F. and Knochel, S. (2012) Cold atmospheric pressure plasma treatment of ready-to-eat meat: inactivation of *Listeria innocua* and changes in product quality. Food microbiol, 30, 1-6.
- Rowan, N.J. (2011) Defining established and emerging risks in the aquatic environment: current knowledge, implications and outlooks. Int J Microbiol, 462832.
- Schnabel, U., Niquet, R., Krohmann, U., Polak, M., Schlüter, O., Weltmann, K.-D. and Ehlbeck, J. (2012). Decontamination of microbiologically contaminated seeds by microwave driven discharge processed gas. JASA (Journal of Agricultural Science and Applications), 1, 99 – 105.

- Scholtz, V. et al., (2015) Nonthermal plasma A tool for decontamination and disinfection. Biotechnol. Adv, 33(6), 1108–1119.
- Setlow, P. (2006) Spores of Bacillus subtilis: their resistance to killing by radiation, heat and chemicals. J Appl Microbiol 101, 514-525
- Sharma, G., Rao, S., Bansal, A., Dang, S., Gupta, S. and Gabrani, R. (2014) Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilm: Potential therapeutic targets. Biologicals, 42, 1-7.
- Song, H.P., Kim, B., Choe, J.H., Jung, S., Moon, S.S., Choe, W. and Jo, C. (2009) Evaluation of atmospheric pressure plasma to improve the safety of sliced cheese and ham inoculated by 3-strain cocktail Listeria monocytogenes. Food Microbiol, 26, 432-436.
- Srey, S. et al., (2014) Reduction effect of the selected chemical and physical treatments to reduce L. monocytogenes bio films formed on lettuce and cabbage. Food Res. Int, 62, pp.484–491.
- Stoffels, E., Sakiyama, Y. and Graves, D.B. (2008) Cold atmospheric plasma: charged species and their interactions with cells and tissues. IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci, 36, 1441 1457.
- Sun, Y., Yu, S., Sun, P., Wu, H., Zhu, W., Liu, W., Zhang, J., Fang, J. and Li, R. (2012) Inactivation of *Candida* biofilms by non-thermal plasma and its enhancement for fungistatic effect of antifungal drugs. PLoS ONE 7(7): e40629. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.004062
- Terrier, O., Essere, B., Yver, M., Barthelemy, M., Bouscambert-Duchamp, M., Kurtz, P., VanMechelen, D., Morfin, F., Billaud, G., Ferraris, O., Lina, B., Rosa-Calatrava, M., Moules, V. (2009) Cold plasma technology efficiency against different airborne respiratory viruses. J Clin Virol 45, 119-124.
- Van Boxstael, S., Habib, I., Jacxsens, L., De Vocht, M., Baert, L., Van De Perre, E., Rajkovic, A., Lopez-Galvez, F., Sampers, I., Spanoghe, P., De Meulenaer, B and Uyttendaele, M. (2013) Food safety issues in fresh produce: Bacterial pathogens, viruses and pesticide residues indicated as major concerns by stakeholders in the fresh produce chain. Food Control, 32, 190-197.
- Veen, H.V.B. De et al., (2015) Inactivation of chemical and heat-resistant spores of Bacillus and Geobacillus by nitrogen cold atmospheric plasma evokes distinct changes in morphology and integrity of spores. Food Microbiology, 45, 26–33.
- Venezia, R.A., Orrico, M., Houston, E., Yin, S.M., Naumova, Y.Y. (2008) Lethal activity of nonthermal plasma sterilization against microorganisms. Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol 29, 430-436.
- Wan, J., Coventry, J., Swiergon, P., Sanguansri, P. and Versteeg, C. (2009) Advances in innovative processing technologies for microbial inactivation and enhancement of food safety e pulsed electric field and low-temperature plasma. Trends Food Sci. Technol, 20, 414-424.
- Williams, P. (2007) Quorum sensing, communication and cross-kingdom signalling in the bacterial world. Microbiology 153, 3923-3938.
- Yasuda, H., Miura, T., Kurita, H., Takashima, K., Mizuno, A. (2010) Biological evaluation of DNA damage in bacteriophages inactivated by atmospheric pressue cold plasma. Plasma Process Polym 7, 301-308.
- Zhang, M. et al., (2013). Bactericidal effects of nonthermal low-pressure oxygen plasma on S. typhimurium LT2 attached to fresh produce surfaces. J. Food Eng, 119(3), 425–432.
- Ziuzina, D. et al., (2014) Dielectric Barrier Discharge Atmospheric Cold Plasma for Inactivation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Biofilms. Plasma medicine, 4, 137–152.
- Ziuzina, D. et al., 2014. Atmospheric cold plasma inactivation of Escherichia coli, Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium and Listeria monocytogenes inoculated on fresh produce. Food Microbiol, 42, 109–116.

- Ziuzina, D., Boehm, D., et al., (2015) Cold plasma inactivation of bacterial biofilms and reduction of quorum sensing regulated virulence factors. PLoS ONE, 10(9).
- Ziuzina, D., Han, L., et al., (2015) Cold plasma inactivation of internalised bacteria and biofilms for Salmonella enterica serovar typhimurium, Listeria monocytogenes and Escherichia coli. Int. J. Food Microbiol, 210, pp.53–61.

List of figure legends

Figure 1: Schematic diagram of a) DBD-CP: 1 – power supply, 2 – electrodes, 3 – dielectric barrier, 4 –plasma discharge, 5 – sample; b) Plasma Jet: 1 – power supply, 2 – high voltage electrode, 3 – tube electrode, 4 – nozzle, 5 – ring electrode, 6 – gas inlet, 7 – plasma discharge, 8 - sample. Adapted from Lu et al (2012).

Figure 2: Mechanisms of cold plasma generated reactive species with respect to complexity of microbiological challenges.

Figure 3: Microbial challenges associated with disinfection

Figure 4: Parameters influencing plasma treatment decontamination efficacy

Figure 5: Cold plasma mechanisms of action on biofilms. Lee et al (2009), Alkawareek et al (2012), (Fricke et al 2012), Pei et al (2012), Sun et al (2012) and Ziuzina et al 2014, 2015).



Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4



