Isotopic evidence for changing mobility and landscape use patterns between the Neolithic and Early Bronze Age in western Ireland


Published in:
Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports

Document Version:
Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:
Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights
Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.
This manuscript is distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/), which permits distribution and reproduction for non-commercial purposes, provided the author and source are cited

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.
Isotopic evidence for a change in mobility and landscape use patterns between the Neolithic and Early Bronze Age in western Ireland

Christophe Snoeck\textsuperscript{1,2,3,4,*}, Carleton Jones\textsuperscript{5}, John Pouncett\textsuperscript{1}, Steven Goderis\textsuperscript{2}, Philippe Claeys\textsuperscript{2}, Nadine Mattielli\textsuperscript{3}, Antoine Zazzo\textsuperscript{6}, Paula J. Reimer\textsuperscript{7}, Julia A. Lee-Thorp\textsuperscript{1}, Rick J. Schulting\textsuperscript{1}

\textsuperscript{1}Research Laboratory for Archaeology and the History of Art, School of Archaeology, University of Oxford, Dyson Perrins Building, South Parks Rd, Oxford, OX1 3TG, UK
\textsuperscript{2}Research Unit: Analytical, Environmental & Geo-Chemistry, Dept. of Chemistry, Vrije Universiteit Brussel, AMGC-WE-VUB, Pleinlaan 2, 1050 Brussels, Belgium
\textsuperscript{3}G-Time Laboratory, Université Libre de Bruxelles, CP 160/02, 50, Avenue F.D. Roosevelt, B-1050 Brussels, Belgium
\textsuperscript{4}Research Laboratory for Archaeology and the History of Art, School of Archaeology, University of Oxford, Dyson Perrins Building, South Parks Rd, Oxford, OX1 3TG, UK
\textsuperscript{5}School of Geography and Archaeology, Arts/Science Building, National University of Ireland Galway, University Road, Galway, Ireland
\textsuperscript{6}Archéozoologie, Archéobotanique : sociétés, pratiques et environnements (AASPE), Muséum national d’histoire naturelle, CNRS, Sorbonne université, CP 56, 55 rue Buffon 75005 Paris, France
\textsuperscript{7}CHRONO Centre for Climate, the Environment, and Chronology, Queen’s University of Belfast, Belfast BT7 1NN, Northern Ireland, UK
\textsuperscript{*}Corresponding author – christophe.snoeck@vub.be

\textbf{ABSTRACT} – This paper presents the results of a study using strontium, oxygen and carbon isotopes, strontium concentrations, infrared analyses and radiocarbon dating to investigate human mobility as seen in individuals from the Neolithic court tomb of Parknabinnia, Co. Clare, Ireland. Taking advantage of the recent demonstration that it is possible to obtain reliable \textit{in vivo} strontium isotope signals from calcined bone, we compare measurements on cremated bone (n = 4) and uncremated tooth enamel (n = 4). The results suggest that two out of four uncremated enamel samples can be considered ‘local’ while the other two, and all four cremated bone samples, represent ‘non-local’ individuals. New radiocarbon dates obtained on two of the cremated bone fragments place them in the Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age, rather than the Neolithic ages for the uncremated remains, demonstrating re-use of the monument. Assuming that our small sample is representative, it seems that the court tomb was used for burial by both ‘locals’ and ‘non-locals’ during the Neolithic and predominantly by ‘non-locals’ in the Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age. This stands in contrast to the nearby Early Neolithic portal tomb of Poulnabrone where only one individual (of 17 analysed) appears to be an ‘outsider’. This study suggests that, even within a small region, mobility and landscape use may have differed significantly within the Neolithic and also between the Neolithic and the Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age.
INTRODUCTION

Funerary practices in the Irish Neolithic included the placement of both uncremated and cremated human remains in mortuary monuments, including court tombs. These monuments were constructed in the earlier Neolithic (from c. 3750 cal. BC), but use could have continued for centuries during the Neolithic and also sometimes re-used in the Chalcolithic (c. 2450–2150 BC) and the Early Bronze Age (c. 2150–1500 BC). Use and re-use involved both cremation and inhumation (Jones et al. 2015; Schulting et al. 2012). The reasons behind the choice of one funerary rite over the other are poorly understood. One possibility is that the cremated human bone represents only token deposits brought to the site from cremations that took place elsewhere, while non-cremated human remains represent the local dead. Given the long use-histories of some court tombs, might the occurrence of both practices within a single tomb reflect a diachronic shift in funerary rites?

In this paper, carbon, oxygen and strontium isotope ratios, strontium concentrations, radiocarbon dating, and infrared analyses are applied to address these questions of human mobility, funerary practice and tomb re-use at the earlier Neolithic court tomb at Parknabinnia, Co. Clare. We analysed both cremated bone and uncremated tooth enamel to investigate the possibility whether the former were part of token deposits brought to the monument from other locations. If so, we might expect their strontium isotope results to reflect a wider variety of lithologies than seen in the uncremated enamel, which could represent the deceased of the local community. Our results are compared to those previously published on uncremated enamel from the nearby Early Neolithic portal tomb at Poulnabrone, Co. Clare (Ditchfield 2014; Kador 2010; Kador et al. 2014).

The skeletal tissue of choice in C, O and Sr isotope studies is dental enamel, since this has been shown to be far more resistant to diagenesis than either dentine or bone (Tuross et al. 1989; Budd et al 2000; Hoppe et al. 2003; Lee-Thorp & Sponheimer 2003). Recent experimental work, however, has demonstrated that calcined bone, because of its substantially greater crystallinity and thus resistance to external influences, also provides a reliable substrate for strontium isotope analyses (Harvig et al. 2014; Snoeck et al. 2015). Carbon and oxygen isotopes, however, have been heavily altered by the very high temperature reached during cremation but can still be used to look into the cremation ritual. These observations open up
new possibilities not only for Irish prehistoric archaeology (Snoeck et al. 2016a), but for that of other periods and places as well (e.g. Snoeck et al. 2018).

**Strontium isotope analyses**

Two isotopes of strontium, $^{86}\text{Sr}$ and $^{87}\text{Sr}$, are widely used in mobility studies of humans and fauna. Their ratio ($^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$) varies between different types of bedrock because of the radioactive decay of $^{87}\text{Rb}$, with values ranging from about 0.7 to more than 4.0 due to different geological age, original Rb/Sr values and initial $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ (Faure 1986). After being incorporated into the body through drinking water and the consumption of plants and animals, $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ can be measured in bone and teeth to reflect the consumer’s location at the time the tissue in question formed. Measurements on tooth enamel relate to the time during which the tooth crown formed, and so present an indication of conditions during infancy through to early adolescence, depending on the tooth measured, from c. 4 months to 2-3 years in the case of the first molar (M1) and from c. 3 to 7 years in the case of the second molar (M2), etc. Bone on the other hand continues to remodel, and so provides information relating to the later years of adult life (Hedges et al. 2007; Robin & New 1997).

To study the strontium isotope variations observed in human remains, it is necessary to construct a baseline for the biologically available strontium (BASr) around the site of interest (Bentley 2006; Evans et al. 2009; 2010). The map of the BASr for Ireland (Snoeck et al. accepted) is based on many samples coming from the Burren and surroundings and can thus be used here to contextualize the strontium isotope results obtained on the human remains. With this map, it is possible to compare the local BASr values to those measured on uncremated enamel and cremated bone and identify individuals who consumed the majority of their food close to or far from the site, following the method described in Snoeck et al. (2016a). In short, individuals having strontium isotope ratios compatible with the BASr values of catchments with a radius up to 5 km will be considered to be ‘locals’. Farmers are likely to grow most of their crops and keep their animals within this range most of the time (Chisholm 1968; Jones et al. 1999). Individuals are defined as ‘regional’ if they exhibit a strontium isotope ratio consistent with catchments with a radius of 5–20 km and as ‘outsiders’ if their strontium isotope ratio is more than two standard deviations from the average BASr value measured for the 20 km radius catchment.
Carbon and oxygen isotope analyses and infrared measurements

In tooth enamel, carbon isotopes reflect overall sources of dietary carbon (Ambrose and Norr 1993), while oxygen isotopes primarily reflect drinking water. Following the expected rainfall gradient, oxygen isotopes in groundwaters are more depleted in $^{18}$O in the east than in the west of Ireland (Darling et al. 2003). However, because of the high pyre temperatures reached during cremation, carbon and oxygen in bone exchange with the surrounding combustion atmosphere and in particular with carbon dioxide from the fuel. The final isotope composition represents a complex mixture of carbon and oxygen from the endogenous bone mineral and collagen fractions and that contributed by the fuel used for the cremation (e.g. Zazzo et al. 2011; 2013; Snoeck et al. 2014a; 2016b). It is therefore not possible to directly compare carbon and oxygen isotopes from cremated bone and tooth enamel. Nevertheless, in the case of uncremated enamel, it is possible to observe variations in diet and place of origin, and in the case of cremated bone, together with FTIR (Fourier Transform Infrared) spectroscopy, to assess pyre characteristics such as temperature and ventilation (Lebon et al. 2010; Snoeck et al. 2014b; 2016b). Infrared analyses allow, among other things, for the detection of cyanamide, which has been suggested to appear in bone burned under reducing conditions (Zazzo et al. 2013; Snoeck et al. 2014b; 2016b).

Radiocarbon dating of calcined bone

Twenty years ago, radiocarbon dating of calcined bone (completely white bone burned at temperatures above 650°C) provided reliable results (Lanting and Brindley 1998; Lanting et al. 2001). This has been put to good use in a wide range of archaeological contexts, including Neolithic Ireland (Schulting et al. 2012). While it is important to keep in mind that the old wood effect might impact on the radiocarbon dates of calcined bone (see Hüls et al. 2010; Zazzo et al. 2011; 2012; Snoeck et al. 2014a), reliable results can still be obtained if one can assume that the wood used to burned the deceased, and the deceased are of contemporary age.

Parknabinnia court tomb and its context

The Parknabinnia court tomb (Cl 153 – Figure 1) is located on Roughan Hill within an upland limestone region known as the Burren in north-west County Clare on the west coast of Ireland (Figure 2), an area that seems to have been a particular focus for Neolithic farmers (Jones 2003). The tomb is atypical in that it has a narrow, straight-sided ‘court’ rather than the more usual open court with curving sides, and a short heel-shaped cairn rather than a long, trapezoidal cairn (Jones & Walsh 1996). These features, however, are shared with other court
tombs in the immediate and wider region and they seem to form a morphologically distinct north Munster type (Jones 2019). Radiocarbon dates from an initial sample of twelve uncremated human bones suggest that, like many other court tombs across the country, Parknabinnia was probably initially used c. 3700–3570 BC (the earliest date is 3690–3375 cal. BC at 2σ; GU–10578; 4785±60 BP), but unusually, it continued to be used, if intermittently, up into the first half of the third millennium (GU–10575; 4195±55 BP; 2905–2620 cal. BC at 2σ) (Schulting et al. 2012). As part of the current project, another two radiocarbon dates were obtained for two of the four cremated bone fragments on which isotope analyses were carried out (see below).

The skeletal remains from Parknabinnia were recovered from the tomb’s two chambers, both of which were partially filled with a matrix of loose stones interspersed with disarticulated human bone (both inhumed and cremated), animal bone, potsherds, and lithic and bone artefacts. The potsherds probably represent 5–10 vessels including two Carinated Bowls, at least two simple bowls, and a decorated bowl. These vessels all probably date to the second quarter of the 4th millennium BC (Brindley 2010). The lithics recovered include leaf-shaped arrowheads, a plano-convex knife and a bifacial knife, and two flat stone beads. The bone artefacts include what appear to be two halves of the same toggle with expanded ‘golf-tee’ shaped heads, and a portion of what may be a long, tubular bead with an expanded head. The skeletal remains were highly fragmented, but at least twenty individuals are represented, comprising fifteen adults and five sub-adults. The stratigraphy of the site, the radiocarbon dates, and a taphonomic analysis of the skeletal collection indicate that the Neolithic burial rite at Parknabinnia consisted of successive primary inhumations that were rearranged and disturbed by subsequent inhumations (Beckett 2005a; b; 2011; Beckett & Robb 2006).
Geology, palaeoenvironment, and archaeology of the Burren and surrounding region

In order to interpret the strontium isotope results from Parknabinnia, it is important to understand the region’s geological, landscape, and human histories. The site is situated on Carboniferous limestone, while Carboniferous shale and sandstone occurs less than 5 km to the west, with older Silurian and Upper-Devonian formations to the east and south-east in the Slieve Aughty Mountains (Geological Survey of Ireland). The soils on Roughan Hill today are thin rendzinas (Finch 1971) with bare bedrock exposed in places, but they are nevertheless more developed than in many parts of the Burren. Micromorphological analysis of the sediments underlying the Parknabinnia court tomb indicated the pre-tomb presence of rendzinas and a clay-rich soil that was probably developed, in part, from glacial drift (Lewis 2003).

There is of course the possibility of soil change since the Neolithic on the Burren, which is now a karstic landscape with limited and fragmentary pockets of soil development (Drew 1982, 1983, 2001; Drew & Treacy 2014). In the past these may have been more extensive, and would have included shale and granite-bearing soils deriving from Co. Galway to the north, via glacial movement (Moles & Moles 2002). These materials would be expected to have higher $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ signatures than the Carboniferous limestone. Analyses of pollen cores from the Burren and its immediate surrounds indicate changes in the vegetation that are probably related to changes in soil cover, beginning with initial clearances of the original pine and hazel forest by Neolithic farmers in the earlier 4\textsuperscript{th} millennium BC (Crabtree 1982; Jelicic & O’Connell 1992; Lamb & Thompson 2005; O’Connell & Molloy 2001; Watts 1984).
The palaeoenvironmental evidence, together with the distribution of known Neolithic monuments, suggests a marked preference for well-drained limestone substrates. A core area of Neolithic settlement is present in the south-east Burren with other, possibly less dense, occupation to the west on the Atlantic coast, to the north around the inner shores of Galway Bay, and to the east across the lower-lying limestone of east Clare and west Tipperary (De Valera & Ó Nualláin 1961; 1972; 1982). In contrast, only limited archaeological evidence of Neolithic settlement exists on the poorly drained sandstone and shale south-west of the Burren, although there is a possible court tomb (Cl 50) located in this area, where the small Moy River meets the Atlantic (De Valera and Ó Nualláin 1961). While the preference for siting Neolithic monuments on limestone is clear, there also appears to be a preference for geological/environmental boundaries. This may reflect economies that utilized ecotonal environments and can be seen in the concentration of Neolithic monuments near the southern edge of the Burren where it borders sandstone and shale-derived soils and also in the siting of the east Clare monuments which are within 3–6 km of the contrasting geological formations of the Slieve Bernagh and Slieve Aughty mountains (De Valera and Ó Nualláin 1961).

Although not particularly abundant, evidence for the spatial distribution of Neolithic settlement other than megalithic tombs does seem to be consistent with the monument distributions, which show a particular focus on the southern Burren and lower levels of activity elsewhere (Hull & Comber 2011; Jones 2003). This impression is reinforced by pre-development work in advance of pipelines and roads passing through the region but avoiding the Burren. Although there are likely sampling biases in these studies, the low number of sites and features pre-dating the Chalcolithic encountered on these projects is striking (Delaney et al. 2012; Grogan et al. 2007; Hull & Taylor 2010).

In the subsequent Chalcolithic and Early Bronze Age periods, areas which had previously witnessed Neolithic activity seem to become particularly important activity foci (Jones et al. 2015), and many formerly more ‘quiet’ parts of the landscape show evidence for settlement and ritual activity as well (Delaney et al. 2012; Hull & Taylor 2010). The Neolithic Parknabinnia court tomb is, in fact, set in the midst of a ‘busy’ Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age landscape consisting of the densest concentration of Chalcolithic megalithic wedge tombs in the country along with Chalcolithic/Early Bronze habitation enclosures and field walls (Jones 2016).
MATERIALS AND METHODS

Samples

Only a small number of calcined bone fragments (c. 50 identifiable as human, with a larger number of small unidentified fragments; Beckett 2005a: 227) were encountered in the excavations, and are insufficient in weight to represent even a single individual. The assumption is, then, that these are token deposits from an unknown number of cremations carried out elsewhere. Uncremated teeth, all isolated specimens, were also limited in number. Here, four enamel (T) and four cremated bone samples (B) were selected for infrared, strontium, carbon and oxygen isotope analyses (Table 1). Two cremated bone samples (B1 and B2) were selected for radiocarbon dating.

Table 1 – Human remains from Parknabinnia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Find</th>
<th>Chamber</th>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B1_986.01</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>skull frag</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2_1018.01</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>skull frag</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3_1959.02</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>582</td>
<td>skull frags</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T1_1728.04</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>lower M1</td>
<td>minimal wear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2_1908.11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>582</td>
<td>upper M2</td>
<td>minimal wear; root fully formed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4_1433.01</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>533</td>
<td>skull frag</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3_1952.01</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>incisor</td>
<td>lightly worn, dentine exposed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4_2099.01</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>586</td>
<td>lower M1</td>
<td>cusps lightly worn, exposing dentine</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Three cremated bone and two enamel samples came from Chamber 1, while the other two enamel samples and one cremated bone sample came from Chamber 2 (Figure 1). One of the cremated bone samples was analysed in triplicate (B3a–c). Based on the stratigraphic evidence and their state of attrition, T3 and T4 (slightly worn, exposing dentine) could be from the same individual, as could T1 and T2 (minimally worn, with no dentine exposure). The calcined bone fragments are assumed to belong to different individuals than those represented by the teeth, since cremation would not leave these unaffected. B1 and B2 were found in the same context and could, therefore, derive from the same individual. As discussed below, however, radiocarbon dating of these two samples shows that they represent distinct individuals, both post-dating the Neolithic. The demonstrable problems with stratigraphic integrity make it difficult to determine the number of individuals represented. At minimum, there must be four individuals: two uncremated and two cremated. We return to this below.

Analytical procedures and definition of ‘local’

Details on the various analytical procedures and the geographic assignment of each individual can be found in Supplementary Information.
RESULTS

Biologically available strontium (BASr) in the Burren and surroundings

The map of the biologically available strontium for Ireland (Snoeck et al. accepted) shows that only one geological area within 75 km of Parknabinnia presents lower strontium isotope values relative to the local BASr range (0.7086 ± 0.0004 – Table 2): Carboniferous volcanics and minor intrusions to the south-east (Figure 2). However, several geological formations present higher $^{87}$Sr/$^{86}$Sr values: Upper Devonian to Lower Carboniferous Old Red Sandstone of the Slieve Bernagh mountains east of Parknabinnia; the Ordovician granite formation in Connemara to the north; and the Carboniferous sandstone and shales of west Clare, etc. To evaluate their possible contribution to the strontium isotope values of the studied individuals, average BASr values for 1, 5, 10 and 20 km catchments were calculated for both Parknabinnia and Poulnabrone (Table 2).

Figure 2 – BASr map of the region around Parknabinnia and Poulnabrone (left = median and right = median absolute deviation) based on Snoeck et al. (accepted). A thin coastal strip (50m) is expected to exhibit values near 0.7092 due to the sea-spray effect.

Table 2 – BASr for the outcrop on which each site lies (‘local BASr’) and the average BASr values calculated for 1, 5, 10 and 20 km catchments (± 2SD); the values between brackets represent the number of different geological formations included in the calculation of the average BASr

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>BASr</th>
<th>1km BASr</th>
<th>5km BASr</th>
<th>10km BASr</th>
<th>20km BASr</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poulnabrone</td>
<td>0.7086 ± 0.0004</td>
<td>0.7089 ± 0.0004</td>
<td>0.7090 ± 0.0005</td>
<td>0.7091 ± 0.0006</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parknabinnia</td>
<td>0.7089 ± 0.0004</td>
<td>0.7091 ± 0.0006</td>
<td>0.7093 ± 0.0006</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Radiocarbon dating results
Two cremated bone fragments were radiocarbon dated (B1 and B2). Stratigraphically, these were incorporated into Neolithic deposits, but the results show that they are much later intrusions. B1 returned an early Chalcolithic date (UBA-31468: 2456 – 2415 cal. BC) while B2 is significantly more recent, falling within the Early Bronze Age (UBA-32467: cal. 1971 – 1687 BC) (Table 3). Both dates are several centuries younger than the latest dates on uncremated bone from the court tomb and indicate a previously unknown re-use of the tomb (Figure 3).

Table 3 – Radiocarbon dating results for the cremated bone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Find no.</th>
<th>Lab code</th>
<th>Element</th>
<th>$^{14}$C yr BP</th>
<th>cal BC (95%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B1_986.01</td>
<td>UBA-31468</td>
<td>skull frag</td>
<td>3824 ± 34</td>
<td>2456 – 2415 BC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2_1018.01</td>
<td>UBA-32467</td>
<td>skull frag</td>
<td>3502 ± 55</td>
<td>1971 – 1687 BC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3 – Radiocarbon dates obtained on uncremated (Schulting et al. 2012) and cremated bone (this study) from Parknabinnia.

Infrared, elemental and isotope results

The infrared and carbon isotope results (Table 4) show that cremated bone samples B1 and B4 differ substantially from B2 and B3, having lower carbonate content (BPI – Type B Carbonate to Phosphate Index) and higher cyanamide content (CN/P). Furthermore, B1 and B4 are more enriched in $^{13}$C than B2 and B3. B2 also has higher $\delta^{18}$O values compared to the other samples (Figure 4a). The variability observed in the $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{18}$O values of the three B3 samples is not altogether surprising, as this depends mainly on the composition of the combustion atmosphere.
during cremation, which will be highly variable (Snoeck et al. 2014a; Snoeck et al. 2016b). Even taking into account the large variability observed in B3, the δ¹³C values of B1 and B4 are still distinguished from B2 and B3.

The tooth enamel samples have similar carbon and oxygen isotope ratios (Figure 4b). The δ¹³C values are typical of a terrestrial C₃-plant based diet (Zazzo et al. 2010). As would be expected, the oxygen isotope values are all enriched in ¹⁸O compared to those observed for human and faunal remains from Dublin on Ireland’s east coast (Knudson et al. 2012).

![Figure 4 – δ¹³C_VPDB vs δ¹⁸O_VPDB of (a) the cremated bone and (b) the tooth enamel samples; note the difference in the δ¹³C scales](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4 – Infrared, elemental and isotopic results for tooth enamel (T) and cremated bone (B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Not enough material remaining from B3b for strontium concentration measurement

The ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr results clearly fall into three groups: one (B1 and B4 – Chamber 1 and 2 respectively) with ratios higher than 0.7112; a second (B2, B3, T1 and T2 – all Chamber 1) with intermediate ratios from 0.7096 to 0.7102; and a final group (T3 and T4 – both Chamber 2) with lower ratios of 0.7086/7 (Figure 5). As would be expected, the results obtained for the three sub-samples (B3a, B3b and B3c) of the same calcined bone fragment exhibit limited variation in ⁸⁷Sr/⁸⁶Sr values (0.0004). Once again, B1 and B4 differ from B2 and B3.
Combining the strontium isotope ratios with strontium concentrations further highlights the differences between B1/B4 and B2/B3 as well as between T1/T2 and T3/T4. Two sub-samples of B3 (a and c) returned identical concentrations. The similar isotope ratios and concentrations measured for B1/B4, B2/B3 and T3/T4 suggest that each group originated from a similar place and had a similar dietary plant/meat ratio. T1 and T2, however, present different strontium isotope ratios and concentrations. Strong positive linear correlations are observed for both the tooth enamel ($r^2 = 0.99$, $p = 0.003$) and calcined bone samples ($r^2 = 0.78$, $p = 0.116$). While the correlation for the enamel is statistically significant, both results should be taken as provisional given the small sample sizes, especially as it is difficult to be certain of the number of individuals represented by these samples.

![Figure 5 – Strontium isotope results for the uncremated enamel and calcined bone samples from Parknabinnia; the grey shaded areas correspond to the average BASr values calculated for the different catchments (± 2SD) (see Table 2)](image-url)
DISCUSSION

The present project sought to compare $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values for uncremated dental enamel and cremated bone from Parknabinnia, testing the hypothesis that the former would be more likely to represent individuals from the immediate locality, while the latter might represent the token remains of individuals from further afield, since cremation would facilitate their transportation. The results suggest that the situation is more complex than this, particularly since radiocarbon dates reveal that at least some of the cremated bone post-dates the Neolithic use of the tomb. This highlights the need for caution when material from potentially comingled deposits is being analysed. Without the dates, the interpretation of the $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ results would have been very different, offering some support for the hypothesised difference between the subsistence catchments represented by uncremated and cremated human remains.

Two enamel samples (T3 and T4) from Chamber 2 have $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values consistent with the biologically available strontium isotope range for the immediate vicinity of the site, as well as its 1 and 5 km catchments (together defined as ‘local’). The two other enamel and two cremated bone samples (defined as ‘regional individuals’ and all from Chamber 1) have strontium isotope ratios intermediate between the local BASr value and the adjacent Carboniferous sandstone and shale BASr value located 2–3 km to the west. This falls outside of the ‘local’ range because of the small proportion of the more radiogenic lithological formations contained...
within the 0-5 km catchment. The last two samples (B1 and B4) can be clearly characterised as ‘outsiders’ (see SI), having values above 0.7110, consistent with the Slieve Aughty uplands to the east and south-east (Figure 7). The strontium isotope ratios of T3 and T4 (0.7087–0.7088) suggest that the limestone \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) signal of the Burren was only minimally affected by surficial glacial soils with significantly different values, and hence, at least some of the individuals represented by the calcined bone are likely to be ‘outsiders’. While it is relatively straightforward to evaluate the possible place of origin of T3 and T4 (‘locals’), and the later lives of B1 and B4 (‘outsiders’ probably from the Slieve Aughty uplands), the situation with the remaining four samples (T1, T2, B2 and B3) requires further discussion. Indeed, their \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) values could be the result of consuming a combination of local resources and resources originating from the Slieve Aughty mountains (mudstone/sandstone), and/or those of the adjacent shale and sandstone region of west Clare.

The provisional linear correlation observed in the strontium concentration versus strontium isotope ratios of the tooth enamel fragments (Figure 6) suggests two main sources of strontium, with different strontium-to-calcium ratios. The individual or individuals represented by T3 and T4 clearly consumed foods locally, while T1 and T2 moved between a region with higher Sr/Ca ratios and \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) values reflecting the local limestone. The difference in strontium isotope ratio and concentration for T1 and T2 suggests that these represent two distinct individuals, and that T2 either consumed more food with a higher Sr/Ca ratio than T1, or, those resources were obtained from a geological context with higher Sr/Ca ratio.

The fact that B1 and B4 differ in infrared and in \(\delta^{13}\text{C}\) and \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) values compared to B2 and B3 suggests that the former two derive from a different region. Incidentally, this, together with non-overlapping radiocarbon dates, also indicates that B1 and B2 are distinct individuals as both are cranial fragments in which we would expect to see similar turnover. Furthermore, the low \(\delta^{13}\text{C}\) values and the presence of cyanamide in B1 and B4 could indicate that these bones were cremated in different conditions compared to B2 and B3 (Zazzo et al. 2013; Snoeck et al. 2014b), possibly on smaller and/or less well ventilated pyres, where low O\(_2\) facilitates the incorporation of cyanamide (Snoeck et al. 2016b). Considering all of the above, at least five individuals are represented: T1, T2, T3/T4, B1/B4 and B2/B3.

*Parknabinnia and Poulnabrone*
While there are limited strontium isotope data available to compare with Parknabinnia, the nearby portal tomb of Poulnabrone, Co. Clare, situated on the same geological formations, provides a $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ dataset on uncremated enamel (Ditchfield 2014; Kador 2010; Kador et al. 2014). The onset of burial activity begins earlier here than at Parknabinnia by one to two centuries, but the two sites overlap in use (Schulting 2014). All but one individual at Poulnabrone exhibit values between 0.7082 and 0.7092, consistent with the local BASr value ($0.7086 \pm 0.0004; n = 17$) as well as with those calculated for 1, 5, 10 and 20 km catchments, suggesting that most individuals interred at the site originated in this part of north-west Clare.

The single ‘non-local’ (‘regional’ in the present framework) at Poulnabrone has a value of 0.7102, similar to those from chamber 1 at Parknabinnia (T1, T2, B2, B3), and could have consumed food from the limestone/shale geological divide to the west or from the Slieve Aughty mountains. This individual has been directly dated to the earlier Neolithic (Ditchfield 2014: Table 4.38). The evidence for only one ‘non-local’ (6%) at Poulnabrone (Figure 8), contrasts with Parknabinnia where only T3/T4 is consistent with the local BASr.

The calcined remains at Parknabinnia could have been brought to the site as token deposits after cremation at a more distant location during the Chalcolithic and Early Bronze Age re-use of the tomb, which is in line with the observation that the cyanamide content and carbon isotope ratios are highly variable, and also with the small amount of material recovered. In contrast, it appears that inhumation of local and regional individuals characterized the Neolithic deposits. It is also possible that the differing local and regional $^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}$ values obtained from the tooth samples indicate that different subsets of the local population at Parknabinnia and Poulnabrone.
used different areas of the landscape as their fields and pastures in the Neolithic (e.g., Bogaard et al. 2011).

Given that the strontium isotope analysis of cremated bone is relatively new, few data are available for comparison; nevertheless, cremated bone from northern Ireland dating to the Neolithic and Bronze Age also showed a majority of ‘non-local’ individuals with nine out of fifteen samples showing a ‘regional’ or ‘outsider’ signal (Snoeck et al. 2016a) which is consistent with the results obtained for Parknabinnia where all four calcined samples can be classified as ‘non-local’ (‘regional’ or ‘outsider’).

**CONCLUSION**

Taking advantage of the recent demonstration that cremated bone provides a reliable substrate for strontium isotope mobility studies, we investigated human mobility represented by calcined and uncremated human remains at the earlier Neolithic court tomb of Parknabinnia on the Burren of Co. Clare, western Ireland. At both Parknabinnia and Poulnabrone, uncremated tooth samples belong to local or regional individuals, while calcined bone from Parknabinnia belongs to regional individuals or individuals from other parts of Ireland or further afield. The CN/P and the δ¹³C values obtained on the cremated bone also highlight the possibility that different pyre settings were used, suggesting that these remains may have been brought to Parknabinnia after cremation elsewhere. Both calcined bone samples that were radiocarbon dated in this study (two out of the four samples subjected to strontium isotope analysis) dated to the Chalcolithic and the Early Bronze Age, and so it is possible that all the cremated material post-dates the Neolithic use of the tomb. However, leaving the calcined bones aside, there is still a contrast with Poulnabrone in that two out of three (or four) individuals represented by the uncremated tooth samples from Parknabinnia belong to regional individuals.

Many excavated court and portal tombs have been found to contain both cremated and uncremated human remains; some, such as Creggandevensky, Co. Tyrone, held only cremated remains, though this may be because of differential survival. Further studies incorporating this material will no doubt provide new data for the investigation of mobility not only in the Irish Neolithic, but also in the Chalcolithic and Early Bronze Age (periods that saw the re-use of both monument types and the continued use of both funerary rites), as well as new insights into the reasons underlying the two funerary rites. In this regard, the finding that the cremated
remains at Parknabinnia appear to represent Chalcolithic and Early Bronze Age individuals spending most of their final years away from the site is of particular interest. The extent to which it can be extended to other sites remains to be determined.

The results of this study clearly show that, by combining a wide range of analytical methods, it is possible to better evaluate the minimum number of individuals, ascertain the re-use of a Neolithic monument in later periods, and assess landscape use and possible origins of both uncremated and cremated individuals in prehistory.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was made possible by the financial support of the British Academy (British Academy grant SG130690 ‘Coming to Knowth’, the Quaternary Research Association, and the generous support of the Philippe Wiener-Maurice Anspach Foundation (http://fwa.ulb.ac.be) towards the DPhil of C.S. The VUB and VUB Strategic Research fund are thanked for their financial support for analyses; the Research Foundation – Flanders (FWO) is thanked for C.S.’s and S.G.’s postdoctoral fellowships. We thank D. Fiorillo and J. Ughetto (SSMIM) for their help with the isotope measurements at the Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, Paris. W. Debourge and J. de Jong from the G-Time Laboratory (Géochimie: Traçage isotopique, minéral et élémentaire) of the Université Libre de Bruxelles (Belgium) are acknowledged for their help with the strontium isotope analyses by MC-ICP-MS. We are grateful to the National Museum of Ireland for permitting the analysis of the Parknabinnia material. We would like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their time and useful comments.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


Hull G. & Taylor K. (eds.) 2012. *Beneath the Banner - Archaeology of the M18 Ennis Bypass and N85 Western Relief Road, Co Clare. NRA Scheme Monographs 10*. Dublin: The National Roads Authority.


Ryan S.E., Reynard L.M., Crowley C.G., Snoeck C. & Tuross N. 2018a. Early Medieval Reliance on the Land and the Local: An Integrated Multi-Isotope Study (87Sr/86Sr, δ18O, δ13C,


