

Reducing the cadmium, inorganic arsenic and dimethylarsinic acid content of rice through food-safe chemical cooking pre-treatment

Pogoson, E., Carey, M., Meharg, C., & Meharg, A. A. (2020). Reducing the cadmium, inorganic arsenic and dimethylarsinic acid content of rice through food-safe chemical cooking pre-treatment. *Food Chemistry*, *338*, 127842. Advance online publication. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2020.127842

Published in: Food Chemistry

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal: Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights

Copyright 2020 Elsevier Ltd.

This manuscript is distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/), which permits distribution and reproduction for non-commercial purposes, provided the author and source are cited.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

Open Access

This research has been made openly available by Queen's academics and its Open Research team. We would love to hear how access to this research benefits you. – Share your feedback with us: http://go.qub.ac.uk/oa-feedback

1	Reducing the cadmium, inorganic arsenic and dimethylarsinic acid
2	content of rice through food-safe chemical cooking pre-treatment
3	
4	
5	Pogoson E., Carey M., Meharg C.* & Meharg A.A*
6	
7	
8	Institute for Global Food Security, Queen's University Belfast, Biological Sciences Building,
9	Chlorine Gardens, Belfast, Northern Ireland, BT9 5DL
10	
11	
12	*corresponding authors: A.A. Meharg (<u>aa.meharg@qub.ac.uk</u>) and Caroline Meharg
13	(caroline.meharg@qub.ac.uk)
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

24 Abstract

25 Cadmium, inorganic arsenic and, potentially, dimethyl arsenic acid are carcinogens widely 26 elevated in rice. Here it was identified that the food-safe and common cadmium chelator citric acid efficiently removed cadmium from intact grain via pre-soaking procedure, while also 27 reducing arsenic species. A twostep pre-soaking stage was developed whereby rice was first 28 29 incubated, at ambient temperature, in 1 M citric acid for 12 hours, and then in 1M calcium carbonate for another 12 hours, the latter step to neutralize pH, followed by cooking. When 30 10 different individual types of rice were processed in such a way this resulted in removal 31 32 rates of 79% for cadmium, 81% for inorganic arsenic and a 66% for DMA. The technology is particularly suitable for bulk food processing and could be deployed in the most cadmium and 33 arsenic impacted regions where rice is a staple. 34

- 35
- 36

37 Keywords

38 arsenic, cadmium, DMA, rice

39

41 **1. Introduction**

Paddy rice is a major source of exposure, globally, to the carcinogen and nephrotoxin 42 cadmium (Clemens et al., 2013; EFSA, 2012; Shi et al., 2020) and the carcinogen inorganic 43 arsenic (EFSA, 2009; Carey et al., 2020). Rice can also be elevated in dimethylarsinic acid 44 45 (DMA) (Carey et al. 2020), which is thought to be a carcinogen (Yamamoto et al., 1995). Cadmium and arsenic are specific problems for low-land rice cultivation as paddy 46 management involves anaerobic and aerobic cycling of soils, regulated by irrigation. Under 47 48 reduced conditions, i.e. flooding, arsenic species are mobilized in soil and assimilated by roots, while it is the aerobic periods that cause cadmium assimilation and mobilization (Arao et al., 49 2009). 50

51

There are regions of the world where cadmium and inorganic arsenic are particularly elevated 52 53 in rice, such as the base metal mining zone of South East China, which is also nationally a 54 major rice production region (Williams et al., 2009). Concentrations of both cadmium and arsenic routinely exceed 0.2 mg/kg, the Chinese standard, in Guangdong, Hunan and Fujian 55 provinces (Cai et al., 2019; Nengchang et al., 2018; Williams et al., 2009; Xiao et al., 2018; 56 Zeng et al., 2015), the concentration that the EU state should not be exceeded for cadmium 57 58 (Commission Regulation, 2006) and inorganic arsenic (Commission Regulation, 2015). As the populace of such regions depend on rice as a dietary staple, and there being few alternatives, 59 60 this makes rice production highly problematic. Thus, if cadmium and inorganic arsenic can be reduced in rice then large production regions rice output can be made safer. 61

62

Post-harvest processing of rice can be used to lower grain inorganic arsenic, primarily
parboiling (Rahman et al., 2019) or cooking (Carey et al., 2015; Raab et al., 2009), but such

simple cooking technologies are ineffective for cadmium and DMA. A high water:rice volume 65 removes up to 45% (Raab et al., 2009), while percolating rice with boil water removes up to 66 70-80% (Carey et al., 2015), of grain inorganic arsenic. Inorganic arsenic is predominantly 67 present in rice as arsenite, which is uncharged and relatively soluble at neutral pH (Meharg 68 69 and Zhao, 2012), rice grain itself being circa. neutral. Cadmium is doubly charged and has a high affinity to polar functional groups in biological matrices (Huo et al, 2016; Wu et al., 2016; 70 Zou et al., 2019). DMA has a pK_a of 6.2 (Meharg and Zhao, 2012), requiring acid conditions to 71 72 become neutrally charged. Therefore, more astringent methods are needed to remove cadmium and DMA from rice. 73

74

75 Cadmium is readily complexed with dicarboxylic acids, which include cheap and common food ingredients such as citric acid (Huo et al, 2016; Wu et al., 2016; Zou et al., 2019). Huo et al. 76 77 (2016) found that the separation of rice into starch and protein using an alkaline extraction 78 method, and then followed by washing the protein isolate with citric acid, efficiently removed 79 the cadmium from the extracted rice protein. Zou et al. (2019) found that citric acid could 80 remove cadmium from bran, while Wu et al. (2016) established that citric acid could be used to reduce this element from brown rice flour. Citric acid treatment also was found to reduce 81 lead (Behrouzi et al., 2020a) and total arsenic (Behrouzi et al., 2020b) from rice grain. Here 82 83 we optimise procedures to remove cadmium from intact rice using citric acid, and then 84 developed processes to neutralize the subsequent acidification of pH. The consequences for inorganic arsenic and DMA, and for mineral nutrients, was also determined. 85

86

87

89 2. Materials and Methods

90 2.1 Experiments

Packaged commercial rice grain was purchased from retail stores in Belfast, Northern Ireland.
Ten polished rice samples were tested including Italian, Thai and basmati. One Italian arborio
rice was selected on which to conduct initial optimization trials. The developed procedure
was then validated on the other grains. Throughout, a rice to preparation/cooking solution
ratio of 1:5 was used as this has been shown to very effective in decreasing inorganic arsenic
(Carey et al., 2015).

97

For the initial experiments rice (50 g) was accurately weighed from the rice packet (dry weight 98 99 was calculated separately), and then soaked in 250ml of a range of concentrations of both 100 citric and ascorbic acid (0, 0.0001, 0.001, 0.01, 0.1 and 1 M) in a 400 ml flat bottomed Pyrex 101 beaker for 12 hours, pre-determined by experimentation to be optimized soaking time, in 102 triplicate. After soaking, the rice samples were rinsed thoroughly with double distilled, 103 deionized Millipore water and then cooked on a traditional hotplate for approximately 10 104 mins till soft. The excess water was discarded, and samples were analysed for cadmium, 105 arsenic species, and a range of mineral nutrients and pH. A second phase of experiments 106 identified how to neutralize rice after citric acid treatment. Rice sample weights, soaking ratios and preparation procedures were identical to the initial phase, but following citric acid 107 108 treatment and rinsing, a second 12 hour soaking stage, followed by rinse, was tested where calcium carbonate (0, 0.1 and 1 M) was used, and then the rice finally cooked. Once optimal 109 cooking procedures were identified, then the 10 different rice samples were prepared. This 110 111 involved a 12-hour soak in 1 M citric acid, then a rinse; a 12 h soak in 1 M calcium carbonate, 112 and then a rinse, and then cooking till rice was prepared. Throughout, uncooked (i.e. straight out of the packet) and traditionally cooked rice (straight from packet and cooked in a 1:5 rice
to purified water ratio) were also conducted to test the efficacy of the modified procedures.

116 **2.2 Chemical analysis**

For all experiments, uncooked and cooked grain rice was freeze-dried overnight. Samples were then milled to a powder using a Retch PM 100 rotary ball-mill using a zirconium oxide lined vessel and grinding balls, at 500 rpm for 4mins. Samples were then analysed for total elementals by ICP-MS and XRF, arsenic speciation by ion-chromatography-ICP-MS, and pH.

121

For ICP-MS total elemental analysis, milled samples were accurately weighed (0.1 g) into 50ml 122 polypropylene centrifuge tubes. To each tube, 2ml of concentrated 69% Aristar nitric acid was 123 added and left to sit overnight. Analytical grade hydrogen peroxide (2ml) was then added and 124 125 allowed to outgas for 15mins. Samples were prepared in batches of 40 and included a blank 126 and a rice CRM, NIST 1568b rice flour which is certified for a wide range of both trace and 127 macro elements. Microwave digestion in a CEM MARS 6 instrument was then carried out under conditions 95°C for 5 min held for 10 min, 135°C for 5 min held for 10 min and 180°C 128 for 5 min held for 30 min. Total elements were then measured using the Thermo ICAP Q ICP-129 MS in direct acquisition mode, with rhodium as an internal standard. All elements reported 130 131 in results were present in the existing in calibration standards (SPEX Europe), as well as in 132 CRM NIST 1568b. Elements with adequate CRM recoveries (50-150%) were reported, along with LoDs (Table 1). 133

134

For inorganic arsenic speciation, ~0.1 g of powdered rice was accurately weighed into 50ml
polypropylene centrifuge tubes to which 2ml of dilute 69% Aristar nitric acid was added and

left overnight. Samples were prepared in batches of 40 that included a blank and CRM NIST 137 138 1568b Rice flour which is certified for arsenic species. Microwave digestion was conducted under similar conditions to the table above. Following digestion, the digestate was then 139 diluted to 10ml with distilled water and 700 ul was transferred to a 2ml polypropylene vial, 140 to which 0.7 ul of analytical grade hydrogen peroxide was added. The rice solution was then 141 run on a Thermo Scientific IC5000 Ion Chromatography system with a Thermo AS7, 2x250 mm 142 column (and a Thermo AG7, 2x50 mm guard column) with a gradient mobile phase (A: 20 mM 143 144 ammonium carbonate, B: 200 mM ammonium carbonate- starting at 100% A, changing to 100% B, in a linear gradient over 15 mins) interfaced with the Thermo ICAP Q ICP-MS which 145 146 monitors m/z⁺ 75, using helium gas in collision cell mode. The resulting chromatogram was 147 compared with authentic standards DMA, inorganic arsenic, monomethylarsonic acid (MMA), trimethyl arsenic oxide (TMAO), tetramethyl arsonium (TETRA) and arsenobetaine (AB). 148

149

A bench top XRF (Rigaku CG) was used to analyse additional elements using the milled rice samples. Batches of 9 samples were analysed in triplicate with CRM NIST 1568b rice flour. Approximately 3 g of each rice sample was weighed into prepared XRF cups lined with proline film and pressed using a PANAPRESS. Following XRF analysis, elements present in the CRM with good analytical recoveries (50-150%) were reported (Table 1).

155

To measure the rice pH after pre-soaking step and subsequent cooking, a 2:1-part water to rice ratio slurry was made and the pH meter swirled until a steady pH reading was obtained.

- 159 Half limit of detection (LoD) was used for elemental concentrations below LoD. LoDs are
- reported in Table 1. Statistical analysis was conducted using two-way ANOVA in MiniTab 18
- 161 as well as sample t-test in where applicable.
- 162

163 **3. Results**

Cadmium in the rice investigated ranged by over an order-of-magnitude, from 0.006 to 0.077 164 mg/kg (Figure 1). Total arsenic in the grain had a similarly large range, from 0.02 to 0.095 165 mg/kg. Chemical analysis of rice grains before and after pre-soaking treatment and cooking 166 showed that citric acid pre-soaking resulted in a maximal 81 % removal of cadmium at 1M 167 concentration (P<0.0001), with the efficacy of removal increasing as acid concentration rose 168 (Fig. 1). Decrease in cadmium was linear with log10 increase in citric acid concentration 169 170 (P<0.0001). Citric acid inhibited total arsenic removal, as compared to the control, with a linear increase with log10 increase in citric acid (P<0.0001). However, even at 1 M citric acid, 171 172 the highest concentration, 1/3 of total arsenic was removed as compared to the uncooked grain. The pH after soaking in citric acid showed a progressive decrease from a pH of 6.4 to 173 2.5 (Fig. 1). 174

175

The use of calcium salts for pH neutralization of organic acid treated grain was then investigated. Trials found that the rice required a 12-hour soak for maximum pH neutralization to occur, with calcium carbonate being the most effective (Fig. 2). The pH increased linearly with time. Soaking the citric acid treated rice in calcium carbonate linearly (P=0.0001) increased pH up to 7.5 at 12 hours.

181

The optimal procedures for removing cadmium were a soaked for 12 hours in 1 M citric acid, thoroughly rinsed, and then soaked for 12 hours in 1 M calcium carbonate, followed by subsequent boiling in water (Fig. 3). For the 10 rice types this sequence, on average caused cadmium to be reduced >60 %, with a standard error of 4.6 %, of the starting raw rice grain. Standard traditional cooking of rice resulted in a slight enhancement of cadmium

187 concentration (5 %), while treatment with citric acid alone caused an 80 % reduction in cadmium. The calcium carbonate soak caused cadmium in citric acid treatment to be doubled, 188 189 probably due to trace cadmium concentrations in the calcium carbonate, given that the rice 190 in the citric acid treatment was very low in cadmium. Median changes in grain cadmium, 191 comparing water, citric acid and citric acid plus carbonate were significant (P=0.0001) when 192 analysed using Kruskal-Wallis analysis. For total arsenic, cooking in 5:1 water to rice ratio reduced arsenic to 66% of uncooked grain, but further reductions were seen when a citric 193 194 acid pre-soak was used (46%) and citric acid and calcium carbonate in combination (38%). These medians were significantly different from each other at P=0.05. 195

196

197 To explore the arsenic data further, speciation was conducted (Figure 4). Inorganic arsenic dominated species, with inorganic arsenic averaging 0.08 mg/kg, and DMA 0.033 mg/kg. 198 199 Cooking in a 5:1 water to rice ratio reduced inorganic arsenic by ~60%, from 0.08 to 0.033 200 mg/kg, with further reductions on citric acid treatment (to 0.02 mg/kg) and citric acid plus 201 calcium carbonate (0.015 mg/kg), a maximum 82% reduction, on average. These percentage 202 differences were highly significant when tested by Kruskal-Wallis analysis (P<0.0001). The DMA did not alter concentration on cooking alone, but a 50% reduction was observed on citric 203 acid, and a 66% reduction on calcium carbonate treatment, from a starting concentration of 204 0.032 mg/kg (P<0.0001). 205

206

Five-to-one water to rice cooking ratios decreases phosphorus by a 2/3, zinc by 1/3 and potassium by 5/6 across the 10 rice types tested, with all these differences being significant at P<0.0001 (Figure 5). Citric acid pre-soak strips out more potassium, zinc and sulphur, but not phosphorus and calcium to any major consequence. The calcium carbonate soak has little

- effect on all nutrients examined except for calcium, which was fortified in cooked grain by 2-
- orders of magnitude (P<0.0001). Calcium carbonate also restored pH of the rice from a mean
- level of 2.4 in citric acid alone treated rice to 7.3 when the citric acid treatment was followed
- by a subsequent calcium carbonate soak (P<0.0001).

215 **4. Discussion**

Here we showed that simple soaking treatments in citric acid and then calcium carbonate
reduced cadmium and inorganic arsenic by ~ 80 % (60 % for cadmium after pH neutralization),
and DMA by 2/3, while fortifying with calcium by 2-orders of magnitude. This means that rice
from highly impacted mining regions, typified by the S.E. China mining belt (Cai et al., 2019;
Nengchang et al., 2018; Williams et al., 2009; Xiao et al., 2018; Zeng et al., 2015), can be made
much safer for human consumption.

222

The loss of essential nutrients observed here, as compared to conventional cooking, conforms 223 with the study by Mwale et al. (2018) which reported that the use of excess water in rice 224 225 cooking for arsenic removal resulted in a significant loss of all essential elements except iron, selenium and copper. Similarly, Carey et al. (2015) highlighted a 53 % potassium loss following 226 227 the use of percolating boiling water for rice cooking to remove arsenic. Fortifying nutrients 228 into grain is common practise, and in many regions of the globe is used as standard to improve 229 the health of the populace (Dwyer et al., 2015). We propose that such fortification can be 230 conducted at the neutralization stage as it was very effective for calcium here.

231

It is well understood that inorganic arsenic is readily stripped from rice by pre-soaking in and cooking in large volumes of water to rice, while DMA and cadmium are not (Carey et al. 2015; Raab et al., 2009). So, having procedures to remove DMA, and particularly, cadmium from rice is an important advance. The pK_a for DMA is 6.2, and this may explain its enhanced mobility when the pH is dropped, i.e. it becomes fully protonated and, thence, neutral and mobile (Meharg and Zhao, 2012). Caruso et al. (2001) found that DMA and inorganic arsenic could be decreased in freeze-dried apple samples that were treated with a solution including

acetic (extraction efficiency range 79% to 117%). For inorganic arsenic a low pH per se does
 not enhance mobilization due to a pK_a of 9.2 for arsenite (Meharg and Zhao, 2012), so the
 reason why lower pH mobilizes arsenite is not known in the experiments reported here.

242

243 Cadmium is readily complexed by dicarboxylic acids, such as citrate (Huo et al., 2016; Wu et al., 2016; Zou et al., 2019) and this, along with the drop to a low pH, explains its enhanced 244 mobility and leaching under the protocols developed here. Wu et al. (2016) trialled citric, 245 246 malic and tartaric acid for the removal of cadmium from brown rice and found citric acid to be optimal, removing up to 94 %. They noted that quality of brown rice was not affected. 247 However, they only used up to 0.06 M, as opposed to 1 M here that removed only up to 80 % 248 249 but causing a considerable drop in pH. Presumably, this was due to Wu et. (2016) using flour as opposed to intact grain, with intact grain being more intractable. A very highly liquid:solid 250 251 ratio was optimal, 12:1, with lower ratios extracting less. They did not test for mineral 252 nutrients. Huo et al. (2016) removed 95 % of cadmium from rice protein extracts using citric acid at 0.5 M citric acid in a 6:1 ratio. They had trialled a wide range of acids, food safe and 253 254 non-food safe, (hydrochloric, lactic, maleic, malic, oxalic, phosphoric and tartaric), and found that concentrations above 0.2 M were required to be effective, with enhanced removal up to 255 0.6 M. Liquid:solid ratio had to be above 6 for effective removal. pH and loss of mineral 256 nutrients were not recorded. Similarly, 0.15 M citric acid at a 10:1 liquid:solid ratio was 257 effective at removing 94 % of cadmium from rice bran (Zou et al., 2019). The overall chemical 258 structure of the bran was not greatly affected, while vitamin E compounds and rice analogues 259 were slightly enriched. The vitamin B suite was not analysed, and neither were mineral 260 261 nutrients or pH. They found that citric acid opened the structure of the rice (using SEM), and 262 that there was little difference in FTIR spectra. We conducted SEM and FTIR on our samples,

including the calcium carbonate treated samples, and concluded the same that treatment did
not greatly affect the structure of grain (data not shown). As well as acids, neutral deep
eutectic solvents, which act as micelles, were used to efficiently extract cadmium (>90%) from
rice flour, again with a large solvent:solid ratio, 12:1, being most effective (Huang et al., 2018).
The consequences on arsenic species, and nutrients and vitamins were not explored.

268

Previous approaches to cadmium removal from rice have used microbial fermentation. 269 270 Incubation with *Bacillus* and yeast species resulted in 81% removal of cadmium Zhang et al. (2017). However, it required 60 hours of fermentation for optimum cadmium removal and 271 272 resulted in a decrease in protein content. Similarly, Zhai et al. (2019) found that fermentation 273 of rice with Lactobacillus plantarum strains resulted in a 93% cadmium removal, reducing protein, lipid and ash contents of rice grain. Although effective at cadmium removal, these 274 275 post-harvest approaches are labour and capital intensive and thus may not appeal to rice 276 producers, manufacturers and consumer. It is like that fermentation is effective in cadmium 277 removal due to increased acidity and to the opening up of rice structure, making cadmium 278 more leachable.

279

A more radical approach to reducing cadmium exposure from rice grain was developed by Sun et al. (2020). They proposed to reduce gut availability of cadmium, derived from rice, by adding components to food that with absorb cadmium in the gut using an *in* vivo mouse model. These included tannic acids, titanium dioxide and zinc glutamate, amongst others, achieving a 10-98% reduction in gut bioavailability of cadmium. However, their findings may be limited in translation to humans in that human gut microbiology is more complex, and that dietary interventions rely on palatability/acceptability.

288	The procedures outlined here have their limitations, and studies still needs to be conducted
289	on food acceptability/palatability, and potential products for the rice cooked in this way may
290	need developing. Refinement of these procedures lies in the hands of food technologists.
291	However, we have established that cadmium, in tandem with inorganic arsenic and DMA, can
292	be removed using food-safe chemical procedures. Also, we have ascertained that subsequent
293	neutralization is also a very useful step, not just for readjusting pH, but also for any potential
294	fortification (calcium in this case).
295	
296	
297	
298	
299	
300	
301	
302	
303	
304	
305	

306	References
-----	------------

Arao, T., Kawasaki, A., Baba, K., Mori S., Matsumoto S. (2009) Effects of water management 308 on cadmium and arsenic accumulation and dimethylarsinic acid concentrations in Japanese 309 310 rice. Environmental Science Technology, 43, 9361-9367. 311 312 Behrouzi, R., Marhamatizdeh, M.H., Raavilar, V., Rastegar, H., Shoeibi, S. (2020a) Effects of 313 the pre-cooking process using acetic acid and citric acid on lead concentration in rice. Polish Journal Environmental Studies, 29, 545-551. 314 315 316 Behrouzi, R., Marhamatizdeh, M.H., Shoeibi, S., Raavilar, V., Rastegar, H. (2020b) Effects of the pre-cooking process using acetic acid and citric acid on residual arsenic content in rice. 317 318 Polish Journal Environmental Studies, 29, 553-559. 319 320 Cai K., Yu Y., Zhang M., Kim K. (2019) Concentration, source and total health risks of cadmium 321 in multiple media in densely populated areas, China. International Journal of Environmental Research Public Health, 16, 2269. 322 323 Carey M., Jiujin X., Farias J., Meharg A. (2015) Rethinking rice preparation for highly efficient 324 325 removal of inorganic arsenic using percolating cooking water. PLos ONE. DOI: 10(7): e0131608. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0131608. 326 327 328 Carey, M., Meharg, C., Williams, P.N., Marwa, E., Jiujin, X., Gomes Farias, J., De Silva, P.M.C.S., 329 Signes-Pastor, A., Lu, Y., Nicoloso, F.T., Savage, L., Campbell, K., Elliott, C., Adomako, E., Green,

330	A.J., Moreno-Jimenez, E., Carbonell-Barrachina, Á.A., Triwardhani, E.A., Pandianga, F.I., Haris,					
331	P.I., Lawgali, Y.F., Sommella, A., Pigna, M., Brabet, C., Montet, D., Njira, K., Watts,					
332	M.J., Meharg, A.A. (2019) Global Sourcing of low-inorganic arsenic rice grain. Exposure Health					
333	doi.org/10.1007/s12403-019-00330-y					
334						
335	Caruso J., Heitkemper D., B'Hymer C. (2001) An evaluation of extraction techniques for arsenic					
336	species from freeze-dried apple samples. Analyst, 126, 136-140.					
337						
338	Clemens, S., Aarts, M., Thomine, S., Verbruggen, N. (2013) Plant science: The key to					
339	preventing slow cadmium poisoning. Trends Plant Science, 18, 92-99.					
340						
341	Commission Regulation (EC) No 1881/2006 (2006) Setting maximum levels for certain					
342	contaminants in foodstuffs. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-					
343	content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:02006R1881-20150521					
344						
345	Commission Regulation (EC) No 2015/1006 (2015) Amending Regulation (EC) No 1881/2006					
346	as regards maximum levels of inorganic arsenic in foodstuff. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-					
347	content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:32015R1006					
348						
349	Dwyer, J., Wiemer, K., Dary, O., Keen, C., King, J., Miller, K., Philbert, M., Tarasuk, V., Taylor,					
350	C., Courtney Gaine, P., Jarvis, A., Bailey, R. (2014) Reviews from ASN EB Symposia. Fortification					
351	and Health: Challenges and Opportunities 1-4. DOI: 10.3945/an.114.007443.					
352						

European Food Safety Authority (2009) Scientific opinion of the panel on contaminants in the
food-chain. *EFSA J, 980*, 1-139.

355

European Food Safety Authority (2012) Cadmium dietary exposure in the European
 population. *EFSA J 10*, 2551.

358

- Huang, Y., Feng, F., Chen, Z., Wu, T., Wang, Z. (2018) Green and efficient removal of cadmium
- 360 from rice flour using natural deep eutectic solvents. *Food Chemistry*, 244, 260-265.

361

Huo, Y., Du, H., Xue, B., Niu, M., Zhao, S. (2016) Cadmium removal from rice by separating and
washing protein isolate. *Journal Food Science*, *81*, T1567-T1584.

364

365 Meharg, A.A., Zhao, F.J. (2012) Arsenic and rice. Springer, Netherlands.

366

- 367 Mwale, T., Rahman, M., Mondal, D. (2018) Risk and benefit of different cooking methods on
- 368 essential elements and arsenic in rice. *International Journal Environmental Research Public*
- 369 *Health, 15,* 1056. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph15061056.

370

- Nengchang, C., Xiaoxia, Z., Yuji, Z. (2018) Heavy metal concentrations in rice from Guangzhou
- and associated health risks. *Journal Resources Ecology*, 9, 85.

374	Raab, A., Baskaran, C., Feldmann, J., Meharg, A.A. (2009) Cooking rice in a high water to rice
375	ratio reduces inorganic arsenic content. Journal Environmental Monitoring, 11, 41-44.

Rahman, H., Carey, M., Hossain, M., Savage, L., Islam, M.R., Meharg, A.A. (2019) Modifying
the parboiling of rice to remove inorganic arsenic, while fortifying with calcium. *Environmental Science Technology*, *53*, 5249-5255.

380

Shi. Z., Carey, M., Meharg, C., Williams, P.N., Signes-Pastor, A.J., Triwardhani, E.A., Pandianga,
F.I., Campbell, K., Elliott, C., Marwa, E., Xia, J., Gomes Farias, J., Nicoloso, F.T., De Silva,
P.M.C.S., Lu, Y., Norton, G., Adomako, E., Green, A.J., Moreno-Jimenez, E., CarbonellBarrachina, Á.A., Haris, P.I., Lawgali, Y.F., Sommella, A., Pigna, M., Brabet, C., Montet, D.,
Njira, K., Watts, M.J., Hossain, M., Islam, M.R., Tapia, Y., Orport, C., Meharg, A.A. (2019) Rice
grain cadmium concentrations in the global supply-chain. *Exposure Health*doi.org/10.1007/s12403-020-00349-6.

388

Sun, S., Zhou, X., Li, Y., Xia H., Li, Z., Zhuang, P. (2020) Use of dietary components to reduce
the bio accessibility and bioavailability of cadmium in rice. *Journal Agricultural Food Chemistry*. DOI: 10.1021/acs.jafc.0c01582.

392

Williams, P.N., Lei, M., Sun, G., Huang, Q., Lu, Y., Deacon, C., Meharg, A.A., Zhu Y. (2009)
Occurrence and partitioning of cadmium, arsenic and lead in mine impacted paddy rice:
Hunan, China. *Environmental Science Technology*, 43, 637-642.

396

397	Wu, Y., He, R., Wang, Z., Yuan, J., Xing, C., Wang, L., Ju, X. (2016) A safe, efficient and simple
398	technique for the removal of cadmium from brown rice flour with citric acid and analysed by
399	inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. Analytical Methods, 8, 6313-6322.
400	
401	Xiao, G., Hu, Y., Li, N., Yang, D. (2018) Spatial autocorrelation analysis of monitoring data of
402	heavy metals in rice in China. Food Control, 89, 32-37.
403	

Yamamoto, S., Konishi, Y., Matsuda, T., Murai, T., Shibata, M.A., Matsuiyuasa, I., Otani, S.,
Kuroda, K., Endo, G., Fukushima, S. (1995) Can induction by an organic arsenic compound,
dimethylarsinic acid (cacodylic acid), in F344/DUCRJ rats after pretreatment with 5
carcinogens. *Cancer Research*, *55*, 1271-1276.

408

Zeng, G., Wu, H., Liang, J., Guo, S., Huang, L., Xu, P., Liu, Y., Yuan, Y., He, X., He, Y. (2015)
Efficiency of biochar and compost (or composting) combined amendments for reducing Cd,
Cu, Zn and Pb availability, mobility and ecological risk in wetland soil. *RSC Advances, 5,* 3454134548.

413

Zhai, Q., Guo, Y., Tang, X., Tian, F., Zhao, J., Zhang, H., Chen, W. (2019) Removal of cadmium
from rice by *Lactobacillus plantarum* fermentation. *Food Control, 96*, 357-364.

416

Zhang, L., Lei, Q., Cheng, Y., Xie, Y., Qian, H., Guo, Y., Chen, Y., Yao, W. (2017) Study on the
removal of cadmium in rice using microbial fermentation method. *Journal Food Science*, *82*,
1467-1474.

- Zou, Y., Zhang, X., Ju, X., Wang, Z., Wu, Y., Yuan, J., Chen, W., He, R. (2019) Effect of removing
- 422 cadmium with citric acid one the physiochemical and microstructure properties of rice. *Food*
- 423 *Control, 98,* 290-296.
- 424

Table 1. Recoveries of elements and arsenic species from CRM NIST 1568b, rice flour, along
with limits of detection (LoD).

element	CRM	CRM	CRM	S.E.M	L.o.D.
	reported	recovery	recovery		
	conc.	conc.	(%)		
	(mg/kg)	(mg/kg)			
cadmium	0.0224	0.0162	72.3	0.002	0.006
arsenic	0.285	0.222	77.8	0.018	0.03
potassium	1282	1026	80	4.206	-
zinc	19.4	17.7	91	1.298	1.785
calcium	118	113	96	5.004	-
sulphur	1200	1020	85	3.086	-
phosphorus	1530	1591	104	86.801	19.953
inorganic arsenic	0.090	0.0830	92.2	0.001	0.0004
DMA	0.180	0.155	86.1	0.002	0.0004

Figure 1. The effect of 12 hour soaking in molar concentrations of citric and ascorbic acid
and then subsequent cooking in pure water, on cadmium and arsenic content and pH of
Arborio rice. Each acid concentration was conducted in triplicate. Individual samples are
shown.



Figure 2: The effect of calcium carbonate, calcium chloride and calcium citrate on the pH
levels of rice grain after pre-soaking with the calcium salts for 12 hours and subsequent
boiling. Each salt concentration was conducted in triplicate. Individual samples are shown.



Figure 3: The effect of rice pre-soaking treatments on 10 polished rice types after a 12-hour pre-soak in citric acid, and another 12-hour soak in calcium carbonate and subsequent boiling, with a 12-hour pre-soaking in water as control, on the cadmium and inorganic arsenic acid content. The insert shows the median and 25th percentiles for remaining cadmium. Means and standard errors are shown in the main graph, averages in the insert.



Figure 4: The effect of treatment of polished rice types after a 12-hour pre-soak of white rice
grain in citric acid, and another 12-hour soak in calcium carbonate and boiling, with a 12-hour
pre-soaking in water as control on the arsenic species. Each aligned point represents triplicate
analysis and an average, plus and minus the standard error, presented.



Figure 5: Multi-elemental content (potassium, zinc, calcium, sulphur, chlorine and phosphorus) of polished rice grains. Rice samples were soaked in citric acid for 12 hours and then in calcium carbonate for another 12 hours with subsequent boiling with a 12-hour presoaking in water as control and analysed in triplicate. Each point represents triplicate analysis plus and minus standard error of the mean..

467



468

469