

A multi-layer functional genomic analysis to understand noncoding genetic variation in lipids

Ramdas, S., Judd, J., Graham, S. E., Kanoni, S., Wang, Y., Surakka, I., Wenz, B., Clarke, S. L., Chesi, A., Wells, A., Bhatti, K. F., Vedantam, S., Winkler, T. W., Locke, A. E., Marouli, E., Zajac, G. J. M., Wu, K.-H. H., Ntalla, I., Hui, Q., ... Million Veterans Program (2022). A multi-layer functional genomic analysis to understand noncoding genetic variation in lipids. *The American Journal of Human Genetics*, *109*(8), 1366-1387. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajhg.2022.06.012

Published in:

The American Journal of Human Genetics

Document Version:

Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights

Copyright © 2022 Elsevier Inc.

This manuscript is distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs License (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/), which permits distribution and reproduction for non-commercial purposes, provided the author and source are cited.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

Open Access

This research has been made openly available by Queen's academics and its Open Research team. We would love to hear how access to this research benefits you. – Share your feedback with us: http://go.qub.ac.uk/oa-feedback

1 2 3	A multi-layer functional genomic analysis to understand noncoding genetic variation in lipids
4	Shweta Ramdas*, Jonathan Judd*, Sarah E Graham*, Stavroula Kanoni*, et al.
5	
6	*equal contribution (co-first authors)
7	
8	Corresponding Authors:
9	Xiang Zhu, PhD
10	Department of Statistics
11	Huck Institutes of the Life Sciences
12	The Pennsylvania State University
13	University Park, PA 16802
14	xiangzhu@psu.edu
15	
16	Christopher D Brown, PhD
17	Department of Genetics
18	Perelman School of Medicine
19	University of Pennsylvania
20	Philadelphia PA 19104
21	chrbro@upenn.edu
22	
23 24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

29 Abstract

- 30 A major challenge of genome-wide association studies (GWAS) is to move from
- 31 phenotypic associations to biological insight. Here, we integrate a large trans-ancestry
- 32 GWAS on blood lipids with a wide array of functional genomic datasets to discover
- 33 regulatory mechanisms underlying lipid associations. We first identify lipid-associated
- 34 genes with expression quantitative trait locus colocalizations, and then add chromatin
- interaction data to narrow the search for functional genes. Polygenic enrichment
- 36 analysis across tissues and cell types confirms the central role of the liver in lipids, and
- 37 highlights the selective enrichment of adipose-specific chromatin marks in high-density
- 38 cholesterol and triglycerides. Overlapping transcription factor (TF) binding sites with
- 39 lipid-associated loci, we identify TFs relevant in lipid biology. Finally, we present an
- 40 integrative framework to prioritize causal variants at GWAS loci, producing a
- 41 comprehensive list of candidate causal genes and variants with multiple layers of
- 42 functional evidence. Two prioritized genes, *CREBRF* and *RRBP1,* show convergent
- 43 evidence across functional datasets supporting their roles in lipid biology.
- 44

45 Introduction

46

47 Most GWAS findings have not directly led to mechanistic interpretations, largely

- 48 because 90% of GWAS associations map to non-coding sequences ^{1,2}. Mechanistic
- 49 interpretations in GWAS have proven challenging because the strongest signals
- 50 identified in GWAS typically contain many variants in strong linkage disequilibrium (LD)³
- and functional mechanisms including genes of action are often not clear from GWAS
- 52 data alone ⁴.
- 53
- 54 Linking trait-associated variants to genome function has emerged as a promising model 55 for mechanistic interpretation of non-coding findings in GWAS. This 'variant-to-function' model is premised on recent observations that non-coding variants often affect a trait 56 57 of interest through the regulation of genes and processes in trait-relevant cell types or tissues². Implementing this functional model in GWAS has become more feasible as 58 large-scale functional genomic resources, such as epigenomic ^{5,6} and transcriptomic 59 catalogues ⁵ have been systematically generated across a wide range of human cell 60 types and tissues. Indeed, the integration of functional genomics with GWAS has 61 62 identified regulatory mechanisms in variants associated with obesity ⁷ and schizophrenia⁸, yielding important functional insights in genetic architecture of human 63 64 complex traits.

65

- 66 The history of the human genetics of lipids mirrors the success and challenge of GWAS.
- 67 Increasing sample size and genetic diversity has significantly boosted the power of
- discovery: the first lipid GWAS in 2008 with 8,816 European-descent individuals

- 69 identified 29 lipid-associated loci⁹; the latest study of 1.6 million individuals across five
- 70 ancestries [Graham et al 2021] found 941. Despite the dramatic increase in the number
- of associations, our biological understanding of many of these genetic discoveries
- 72 remains limited. The causal gene has been confidently assigned at only a small fraction
- of these loci², and the regulatory mechanism connecting variant to phenotype has been
- conclusively characterized only for a handful of genes ¹⁰. Furthermore, systematic
- 75 mapping of lipid-associated variants to their biological functions has been missing in
- 76 literature at the time of this study.
- 77
- 78 Here we conduct a genome-scale integrative analysis on the largest GWAS to-date of
- 79 five lipid phenotypes (LDL, or low density cholesterol; HDL, or high density cholesterol;
- 80 TC, or total cholesterol; nonHDL, or non-high density cholesterol; and TG, or
- triglycerides) involving 1.6 million individuals from five ancestries [Graham et al 2021].
- 82 Combining the lipid GWAS with a wide array of functional genomic resources in diverse
- 83 human tissues and cell types, we identify regulatory mechanisms of noncoding genetic
- 84 variation in lipids with a full suite of computational approaches. Further, we develop a
- 85 generalizable framework to understand how tissue-specific gene regulation can explain
- 86 GWAS findings, and demonstrate its real-world value on lipid-associated loci.
- 87

88 Results

- 89 Figure 1: Starting with GWAS summary statistics for five lipid phenotypes, we integrate these
- 90 with eQTL and chromatin interaction data to identify potential genes mediating the GWAS
- 91 association, and use epigenomic annotations from ChIP-seq and ATAC-seq data both to
- 92 identify regulatory mechanisms at these loci, and to arrive at genome-level insights into lipid
- 93 *biology, such as tissue relevance.*
- 94



- 96 We systematically integrated lipid GWAS results [Graham et al 2021] with multiple layers
- 97 of functional genomic data from diverse tissues and cell types to understand regulatory

- 98 mechanisms at lipid-associated loci (Figure 1). Specifically, we overlaid GWAS loci with
- 99 expression quantitative trait loci (eQTL) and chromatin-chromatin interactions to
- 100 identify causal genes. We further assessed polygenic enrichments of tissue-specific
- 101 histone marks to prioritize relevant tissues and examined GWAS loci at transcription
- 102 factor (TF) binding sites to detect lipid-relevant TFs. Finally, we combined all these layers
- to provide a holistic view of gene regulation at lipid loci in relevant tissue and cell types.
- 104
- 105 *Co-localization with eQTLs identifies candidate lipid-relevant genes*
- 106

We identify shared association signals between lipid levels and expression of nearby 107 108 genes as a first step given that most GWAS signals are presumed to influence complex 109 traits through their impact on gene expression ¹¹. To do so, we tested for colocalization of each of the significant lipid GWAS association signals (1,750 loci considering the five 110 111 traits examined) with significant cis-eQTL data across 49 human tissues from the GTEx 112 consortium ⁵. Here, we defined GWAS signals as 1,750 loci reaching genome-wide 113 significance and corrected for shadow signals (Methods) in a trans-ancestry meta-114 analysis for at least one of five lipid traits.

115

116 We then restricted our analysis to those loci likely mediated through regulatory

- 117 mechanisms as opposed to coding variation. In particular, we excluded all loci with
- 118 credible sets containing at least one missense variant (369 of 1,750 loci, 21% of credible
- sets (Paper2). Of the remaining 1,381 GWAS loci, 696 significantly colocalized with eQTLs
- 120 (the ratio of posterior probability of a shared signal to the posterior probability of two
- signals being > 0.9^{12} ; Methods) in at least one of 49 tissues for at least one lipid
- 122 phenotype. This resulted in 1,076 co-localized eGenes (an eGene is any gene with a
- 123 significant eQTL as defined by GTEx); (range of 1 to 16 genes per locus; Table S1). Since
- 124 with eQTL data alone it is difficult to disentangle a single functional gene from multiple
- 125 functional (and likely coregulated) genes at a locus ¹³ we performed all downstream
- analyses with all 1,076 colocalized genes, to further prioritize functional genes at loci
- 127 with multiple eGenes.
- 128
- 129 To acquire additional functional insights of colocalized genes, we assessed their
- 130 enrichments across a wide range of existing biological and clinical gene sets. Colocalized
- 131 genes showed enrichments in 20 KEGG pathways ¹⁴ at FDR 5% (Table S2), including
- 132 known lipid-related processes such as cholesterol metabolism, PPAR signaling and bile
- 133 secretion. These genes were enriched in 33 Mendelian genes from ClinVar¹⁵ associated
- 134 with lipid-related ICD codes (ICD code E78), (3.5 fold enrichment, including *APOB, LPL*,
- and *APOE*), suggesting the shared genetic basis of Mendelian and complex lipid
- 136 phenotypes ¹⁶. These genes were also enriched in 15 genes with rare-variant burden for
- 137 lipid phenotypes from UK Biobank (11-fold enrichment, including genes APOB, LPL, LIPG

and *ANGPTL4*, Figure 2), confirming shared mechanisms of rare and common variation
 underlying lipid traits^{16,17}. Altogether the results demonstrate the biological relevance of
 candidate functional genes prioritized by our approach.

141

142 Figure 2: Enrichment of eQTL/Capture-C overlap, and enrichment in 33 ClinVar gold standard

- 143 genes. A. Numbers of genes identified by two approaches: eqtl colocalization (top panel) and
- 144 promoter capture-c interactions (bottom panel) B. The intersection of eQTL and Capture-C
- 145 *datasets shows an enrichment beyond what is expected by chance, assuming both genesets*
- 146 *are independent. C. The overlap between our list of prioritized genes with three sets of genes*
- 147 previously associated with lipid biology. Capture-C prioritized genes (on the left) show no
- 148 enrichment, whereas colocalized genes (right) show a much higher overlap than expected by
- 149 chance.



- 151
- 152 Chromatin-chromatin interactions improve eQTL-based colocalization
- 153

Our eQTL-based colocalization analysis uses a linear sequence of DNA, and ignores 154 155 physical interaction between non-adjacent DNA segments, another regulatory layer underlying complex human traits ¹⁸. To add this layer to our analysis, we generated 156 promoter-focused Capture-C (henceforth called Capture-C) data from HepG2 liver 157 carcinoma cells (denoted as HepG2.1) and hepatocyte-like cells (HLC) derived from 158 differentiating iPSCs (the latter is described in ¹⁹), as well as publicly-available Capture-C 159 datasets from HepG2^{17,20} (denoted as HepG2.2) and adipose tissue²¹. We defined a 160 GWAS-relevant interaction as any Capture-C interaction between any gene and the 95% 161 162 credible set for a GWAS locus²². Credible set sizes ranged from 1 to 417 variants at the 1,750 examined loci, with a median size of 5 variants per credible set. In total, 1,079 163 164 GWAS loci had at least one variant in the credible set with a physical interaction with a 165 gene promoter and 3,543 of 26,621 genes with promoter-interactions had promoters physically interacting with at least one GWAS credible set variant (Table S3). Unlike 166 167 eQTL-colocalized genes, these genes interacting with their credible sets showed limited enrichment in relevant KEGG pathways and lipid-related genes from ClinVar (Figure 2B). 168 We observed a similar lack of enrichment when we restricted the physical interaction 169 170 analysis to protein-coding genes. 171

- 172 Genes physically interacting with GWAS loci helped shortlist functional genes from eQTL
- 173 colocalization despite their lack of enrichments in known gene sets. Of 1,079 credible
- 174 sets with promoter interactions, 224 also colocalized with eQTLs for the same gene
- 175 (Figure 2A). Among these loci with concordant eQTL colocalizations and Capture-C
- 176 interactions, only 39% of them mapped to a single gene using eQTL data alone, whereas
- adding Capture-C information increased this fraction to 80%. At the gene level, 233
- 178 genes were implicated in both eQTL colocalization and Capture-C interactions,
- 179 representing an enrichment of 2.4. These results showcase the potential value of
- 180 combining eQTLs with physical chromatin interactions to prioritize functional genes at
- 181 GWAS loci.
- 182
- 183 Since eQTLs are likely to reside in the same TADs as the genes they regulate ²³, we
- 184 examined topologically associated domain (TAD) structure from independent datasets
- at lipids GWAS loci with eQTL colocalizations. Of eQTL-GWAS colocalizations in which the
- 186 sentinel variant resided within a liver TAD ²⁴, the colocalized gene resided in the same
- 187 liver TAD 84.8% of the time (enrichment P < 0.001 with 1000 permutations; Methods).
- 188 When we restricted colocalizations to those supported by Capture-C data in any cell
- type, 91.2% fall in the same TAD. These results add to the existing evidence for TAD
- 190 boundaries being regulatory insulators in the cell [cite a recent review] and confirm our
- 191 integration of chromatin interactions with eQTL colocalizations as an effective strategy
- 192 to hone in on functional genes.
- 193

194 *Tissue-specific enrichment of GWAS signals differentiates lipid traits*

- 195
- Regulatory variants often affect complex traits in a tissue-specific manner ²⁵, as shown
 in our eQTL colocalization analysis. Specifically, by computing the ratio of the number of
 colocalizations in a tissue to eQTL sample size in that tissue, we identified that the liver
 was universally enriched for colocalized eGenes with respect to sample size across all
 lipid traits whereas adipose was selectively enriched in HDL and TG only (Figure S1).
- 201 Motivated by these findings, we leveraged systematic approaches and additional data to
- identify relevant tissues and cell types for each lipid trait.
- 203
- 204 We implemented stratified LD score regression (S-LDSC), a polygenic approach not
- 205 restricted only to genome-wide significant variants, on tissue-specific transcriptomic
- and epigenomic annotations to identify relevant tissues for each lipid trait (Methods).
- 207 Consistent with previous studies and our eQTL-based analysis, liver-related tissues
- 208 (tissue-groupings are defined in Table S4) showed strong enrichments across all lipid
- traits (S-LDSC enrichment p-values ranging from 1e-3 in TG to 1e-04 in TC), for both
- expression (Fig 3A) and chromatin annotations (Figure 3B). This result was further
- 211 confirmed by two other approaches (DEPICT ²⁶: Figure S2; RSS-NET ²⁷: Table S5). To

- assess the robustness of our S-LDSC results based on trans-ancestry GWAS data, we
 applied S-LDSC to two population-specific GWAS in GLGC (European and East Asian)
 together with population-specific LD scores (Methods), and we obtained similar results
 (Table S6).
- 216
- 217 Figure 3: Tissue relevance of lipid loci. Partitioning heritability of summary statistics on gene
- 218 *expression (top panel) and active regulatory marks (bottom panel) across tissues. Each*
- 219 plotted point represents each tested dataset for enrichment of heritability; multiple
- 220 annotation datasets are tested for the same tissue group. Each color represents a single
- 221 tissue group, and the y-axis represents P-value of enrichment of heritability. Liver-related

222 *tissues, in teal, consistently show strongest enrichment of heritability.*

223



225

226

227

228 The S-LDSC results also highlighted tissues selectively enriched in certain lipid traits 229 similar to the eQTL-based analysis. The most enriched category for HDL using 230 chromatin annotation is 'Adipose H3K4me1'; for TG, enrichment in liver-related tissues 231 is similar to enrichment in adipose. For LDL, TC and non-HDL, enrichment P-values for the liver were much more significant than for any other tissues (Figure 3B). We observed 232 the same pattern in S-LDSC results based on gene expression (Figure 3A). This finding is 233 consistent with the known influence of adipose on plasma HDL levels ²⁸, and the role of 234 235 adipose as TG deposits. These results were corroborated by eQTL colocalizations stratified by phenotype (Figure S1) and DEPICT analysis on gene expression ²⁶ (Figure 236

S2). Together, these results strongly implicate the liver as the tissue of action for all five
lipid traits, but additionally implicate adipose tissue as playing a role in HDL and TG.

- 240 Given the importance of the liver and adipose in modulating lipid levels, we further identified the relevant cell types within these tissues. Using published single-cell data 241 242 from adipose and liver, we performed gene-set enrichment analysis ²⁹ to identify celltype clusters enriched for genes colocalized with any lipid trait. Out of 11 identified cell 243 244 types in 20 clusters in the liver, only hepatocytes were enriched at P < 0.05 (Figure S3), consistent with previous results²⁰. In adipose, only adipocyte clusters and macrophage-245 246 monocyte clusters showed suggestive enrichment in colocalized genes (Figure S4). Of 247 note, the enrichment in adipocytes was significant when we restricted this analysis to genes that were colocalized only with HDL and TG (FDR-corrected P < 0.05), consistent 248 249 with the selective enrichments of adipose in HDL and TG (but not the other lipid traits) from our S-LDSC analysis. Evaluations at cellular resolution are required to understand 250 251 the cell-type specific mechanisms underlying lipid GWAS loci, but our results could form 252 a useful basis for future studies.
- 253
- 254
- 255

TFs have been implicated as a key mediator of linking genetic variation to complex traits
 ³⁰. To understand lipid GWAS in the context of TF activity, we assessed enrichment of
 genome-wide significant variants at TF binding sites using GREGOR ³¹ and performed
 polygenic enrichment analysis of TF binding sites using S-LDSC.

Overlapping GWAS signals with binding sites highlights lipid-relevant TFs

260

Using ChIP-Seq data from 161 TFs across 91 cell types from the ENCODE project ⁶, 32.7% 261 262 of lipid credible sets overlapped with at least one TF binding site. Using GREGOR ³¹, we 263 identified 137 TFs whose binding sites were significantly enriched in GWAS lead SNPs for 264 at least one lipid phenotype (enrichment > 2; FDR adjusted P-value < 0.05, Figure S5, 265 Table S7). Among these 137 enriched TFs, 69 of them (50%) showed significant 266 enrichments across all five lipid phenotypes, suggesting a potential core regulatory 267 circuit shared by all lipid traits (Figure S5). The TF with the strongest enrichment in all 268 phenotypes was ESRRA (Estrogen-related receptor alpha), a nuclear receptor active in 269 metabolic tissues; ESRRA has been implicated in adipogenesis and lipid metabolism, 270 and ESRRA-null mice display an increase in fat mass and obesity ³². 271

- 272 The GREGOR analysis also highlighted 68 TFs significantly enriched in specific subsets of
- 273 (but not all five) lipid phenotypes (Figure S8). For example, we found 4 TFs (FOXM1,
- 274 PBX3, ZKSCAN1, ZEB1) enriched in HDL and TG only, 4 TFs (EZH2, NFE2, NFATC1,
- 275 KDM5A) enriched in HDL only and 11 TFs (FOSL1, IRF3, JUN, MEF2C, NANOG, PRDM1,
- 276 RUNX3, SIRT6, SMC3, STAT3, ZNF217) enriched in TG only. Of these TFs, the central role

277 of *ZEB1* in adiposity ³³ and fat cell differentiation has been demonstrated ³⁴. Taken 278 together, these TF-centric findings corroborate the selective enrichments of adipose in 279 HDL and TG (but not the other lipid traits) identified in our previous tissue prioritization 280 analyses.

281

282 Similar to tissue prioritization, we also performed polygenic enrichment analysis of TF 283 binding sites using S-LDSC (Table S8), which differed from GREGOR analysis by looking 284 at not only the genome-wide significant associations but also the polygenic signal 285 irrespective of GWAS P-values. On the same 161 ENCODE TFs, this polygenic analysis 286 identified 25 TFs whose binding sites were significantly enriched in heritability for at 287 least one lipid phenotype (Fig S6), and reassuringly, 24 of 25 TFs are also significant in 288 GREGOR analysis. Among these enriched TFs, eight of them (34%) were significantly enriched in all five lipid traits (CEBPB, CEBPD, FOXA2, HDAC2, HNF4G, NFYA, RXRA, SP1; 289 290 enrichment P < 0.05). Of those TFs significant in both analyses, Retinoid X receptor 291 alpha (RXRA) is also a colocalized gene near a GWAS hit (chr9:137,268,682). RXRA is a 292 ligand-activated transcription factor that forms heterodimers with other receptors (including *PPARG*) and is involved in lipid metabolism ³⁵ and homeostasis. While *RXRA* 293 has been implicated as the causal gene at its GWAS locus ³⁶, our study is the first to 294 295 demonstrate its role in lipid biology through its regulatory influence on other lipid 296 GWAS genes.

297

298 Multi-layer functional integration reveals regulatory mechanisms at GWAS loci 299

Motivated by our finding that integrating chromatin interaction improved eQTL 300 301 colocalizations, we further collated multiple lines of functional evidence at each GWAS 302 locus for mechanistic inference. We started with the list of genes with evidence for both 303 eQTL colocalization in the liver or adipose and credible set physical interactions. We 304 next annotated each variant in the 95% credible set with various indicators of regulatory function, including its open chromatin status in liver or adipose-related cell types, its 305 306 proximity to a promoter or an enhancer, and its RegulomeDB regulation probability ³⁷ 307 (see Table S9 for the complete list of annotations used). To account for complexities of 308 regulatory mechanisms and limitations of functional datasets, we combined evidence 309 across these datasets to prioritize variants at GWAS loci (Figure 4A). Specifically, we 310 prioritized variants with at least three independent lines of functional evidence 311 (chromatin openness, physically interaction with target genes, and promoter/enhancer 312 status in liver or adipose), with at least two being in the same tissue with colocalization 313 with the target gene, and with a RegulomeDB score > 0.5. Applying this simple 314 procedure to lipid GWAS we identified 14 candidate loci, each with the strongest multi-315 layer evidence pointing to a single functional variant (Table 1). Below we used *RRBP1* and *CREBRF* to highlight key features of this multi-layer integration framework. 316

317

318 The first example *RRBP1* (Ribosomal binding protein 1) could be identified from eQTL 319 colocalization alone, but our multi-layer integration approach strengthened the 320 conclusion via convergent evidence from various sources (Figure 4B). The RRBP1 eQTL 321 signals in the liver colocalize with LDL, TC and nonHDL. The 'T' allele of the single lead 322 variant (chr20:17,844,684, hg19) decreases RRBP1 expression levels and increases LDL, 323 TC and nonHDL levels. This lead variant at *RRBP1* is in open chromatin in HLC, and also 324 physically interacts with the RRBP1 promoter (250kb away) in adipose and HepG2. All 325 these data based on the lead variant consistently point to *RRBP1* as the functional gene 326 underlying this locus, which is further supported by external data. RRBP1 specifically 327 tethers the endoplasmic reticulum to the mitochondria in the liver--an interaction that is 328 enriched in hepatocytes--and regulates very low density lipoprotein (vLDL) levels ³⁸. Rare variants in *RRBP1* are associated with LDL in humans ³⁹ and silencing *RRBP1* in liver 329 affects lipid homeostasis in mice ³⁸. 330 331

332 Figure 4. A. Variant annotation and prioritization scheme at each credible set. B. Evidence for gene RRBP1 from functional genomics data. The LDL GWAS locus at this region is an eQTL for 333 334 gene RRBP1 in the liver (second panel). Variants in the credible set of this locus interact with 335 the gene promoter in both adipose and HepG2 Capture-C data. The interacting variant is also in an open chromatin peak in three liver-related cell types. C. Multiple sources of functional 336 337 genomics data support CREBRF as a gene contributing to HDL levels. The HDL GWAS locus at 338 this region is an eQTL for gene CREBRF in Adipose (second panel). Variants in the credible set 339 at this locus interact with the CREBRF promoter in adipose. The interacting variant is also in 340 open chromatin in liver-related cell types.



- 342
- 343
- 344 The second example *CREBRF*(CREB3 regulatory factor) demonstrates the power of our
- 345 multi-layer integration framework in prioritizing functional variants (Figure 4C). The
- eQTL signals of *CREBRF* colocalized with a GWAS locus for HDL with 30 candidate
- 347 variants. In contrast, our multi-layer approach identified a single candidate variant
- 348 (chr5:172,566,698) at this locus that physically interacts with the *CREBRF* promoter in

- adipose, was predicted to be a regulatory element (RegulomeDB score=0.91).
- Consistent with the index variant (chr5:172,591,337), the allele 'A' at this functional
- 351 variant increased HDL levels and increased *CREBRF* expression in adipose. Missense
- variants in *CREBRF* have been linked to body mass index, and the gene has been linked
- to obesity risk in Samoans^{40 41}.
- 354

355 Discussion

356

357 Here we integrate the largest trans-ancestry lipid GWAS to date with a wide array of 358 functional genomic resources to understand how noncoding genetic variation affects 359 lipids through gene regulation. Specifically, we identify 1,076 genes whose eQTL signals colocalize with lipid GWAS signals and demonstrate how physical chromatin interaction 360 can improve standard eQTL-based colocalization. We assess tissue-specific enrichments 361 362 of lipid GWAS signals and demonstrate the selective importance of adipose in HDL and triglyceride biology. We examine binding site enrichments of 137 TFs in lipid GWAS and 363 364 expand our understanding of lipid GWAS loci (e.g., RXRA) in the context of TF activity. 365 Finally, we build a simple and interpretable prioritization framework that automatically combines multiple lines of evidence from orthogonal datasets, pinpointing a single 366 367 functional variant at each of 14 lipid-associated loci (e.g., RRBP1 and CREBRF). While there are studies that interpret lipid GWAS associations ^{20,42,43}, the size of our trans-368 369 ancestry GWAS and multi-layer functional integration represent a comprehensive effort 370 and an important step forward in this direction.

371

372 Our multi-layer analysis has two key strengths. First, despite a large array of functional 373 genomic resources being embedded, our analysis produces results with high 374 consistency. For example, the selective enrichment of adipose in HDL and TG identified 375 by S-LDSC is confirmed by our eQTL-based colocalization and TF binding site overlap. 376 Another example is the prioritization of *RRBP1*, which can be identified from eQTL-based 377 colocalziation alone and it is further validated by chromatin openness and interaction. 378 Such convergent evidence from various sources improves the confidence of our 379 findings. Second, our analysis highlights that combining multiple layers of regulatory 380 information can improve sensitivity to prioritize functional genes and variants. For 381 example, we refined eOTL colocalized genes (1,076) to a smaller set of functional genes 382 (233) through integration with promoter Capture-C data. Another example is CREBRF, 383 where eQTL-based colocalization implicates 30 candidate variants and adding other 384 regulatory layers points to a single functional variant. Moving forward, we expect these 385 findings will serve as useful guidelines for future integrative genomic analyses of other 386 traits. 387

Our results rely on the breadth and accuracy of functional genomic datasets used in our 388 analyses. First, unlike our lipid GWAS, current functional datasets ⁴⁴ are limited both in 389 390 sample size and ancestral diversity, which can affect discovery and replication of 391 regulatory mechanisms in diverse populations. Second, some functional datasets are generated at limited resolution. For example, our colocalizations are based on eOTLs 392 393 from bulk tissue RNA-seq ^{5,45}, which may miss detailed cell types and biological processes in which lipid-associated SNPs regulate gene expression ⁴⁵. Third, some 394 functional datasets are not available across the full spectrum of human tissues and cell 395 396 types. For example, our chromatin-chromatin interaction analysis only examines a few 397 cell types in two known lipid-related tissues, producing results that may be biased 398 towards known lipid biology. As more comprehensive and accurate functional genomic 399 resources are becoming publicly available in diverse cellular contexts and ancestry 400 groups, the resolution and power of integrative analyses like ours we applied here will 401 be markedly increased.

402

403 Other limitations of this study stem from computational methods embedded in our 404 framework. First, the colocalization approach 'coloc' assumes one causal variant per locus, whereas recent studies suggest extensive allelic heterogeneity ⁴⁶ consistent with a 405 406 model of a milieu of related transcription factors binding within a single locus. 407 Accounting for allelic heterogeneity in summary statistics-based colocalization typically requires modeling of LD matrix ⁴⁷, which is computationally intensive in large-scale 408 409 analyses derived from many cohorts with diverse ancestries, like the trans-ancestry 410 GWAS examined here. Second, due to restricted access to individual genotypes of 201 411 cohorts, we cannot produce trans-ethnic LD scores within GLGC but have to use 412 European-based LD scores in all S-LDSC analyses. This approach, though less rigorous in 413 principle, provides robust results in practice (as confirmed by our ancestry-specific 414 analysis), largely because 79% of cohorts in GLGC are of European descent [Graham et 415 al 2021]. That said, we caution that the same approach might fall short in ancestrally diverse studies with few European individuals ⁴⁸. Third, our multi-layer variant 416 417 prioritization framework is built on a series of simple rules that are easy to implement 418 on large datasets. This approach could possibly be formalized as statistical models (e.g., priors in Bayesian methods ²⁷, but certainly simplify computation and improve 419 scalability of our framework. Despite the technical limitations, our approach here can 420 421 serve as a useful benchmark for future development of methods with improved 422 statistical rigor and computation efficiency.

- 423 In summary, mapping noncoding genetic variation of complex traits to biological
- 424 functions can benefit greatly from thorough integration of multiple layers of functional
- genomics, as demonstrated in the present study. Although tested on lipids only, our
- 426 integrative framework is straightforward to implement more broadly on many other
- 427 phenotypes, likely yielding functional insights of heritable traits and diseases in humans.

428 Methods

429 *GWAS*

- 430
- 431 We performed GWAS for five blood lipid traits (LDL, HDL, TC, TG, and nonHDL) in 1.65
- 432 million individuals from five ancestry groups <a>\cite{Graham2021} (AFR: African and
- 433 African-admixed; EAS: East Asian; EUR: European; HIS: Hispanic; SAS: South Asian; at 91
- million variants imputed primarily from the Haplotype Reference Consortium or 1000
- 435 Genomes Phase 3. The individual GWAS and meta-analyses (described in Graham et al,
- 436 2021) were performed using the hg19 version of the human reference genome. We
- 437 used MR-MEGA ⁴⁹ for meta-analysis across cohorts.
- 438
- 439 We defined 'sentinel variants' as lead variants representing independent trait-
- associated loci in the genome. These windows are the greater of 500kb or 0.25cM
- 441 around the sentinel variant; genetic distances were defined using reference maps from
- HapMap 3. We performed a second round of conditional analysis conditioning on the
- lead variants to identify and remove any significant windows that are actually shadow
- signals (or dependent on) of a neighboring locus to enforce true independence of
- 445 associated loci.
- 446
- 447 Co-localization with gene expression
- 448

We performed statistical colocalization with eQTLs obtained from GTEx v8. These
summary statistics were in GRCh38, so we first lifted over the GWAS summary statistics
(in hg19) from the trans-ethnic summary statistics to GRCh38 using UCSC liftOver
executable ⁵⁰. For each of the five lipid traits, we used the same 'sentinel variants'
defined in the previous section to represent approximately independent GWASassociated windows (also removing shadow signals as described before).

- 455
- 456 For each such window, we ran an eQTL colocalization using GTEx v8 eQTL summary
- 457 statistics ⁵. For each of 49 GTEx tissues, we first identified all genes within 1Mb of the
- sentinel SNP, and then restricted analysis to those genes with eQTLs ('eGenes') in that
- tissue (FDR < 0.05). We used the R package 'coloc' (run on R version 3.4.3, coloc version
- 460 3.2.1)⁵¹ with default parameters to run co-localization between the GWAS signal and the
- 461 eQTL signal for each of these cis-eGenes, using as input those SNPs in the defined

- window, i.e. all SNPs present in both datasets. A colocalization posterior probability of
 (PP3+PP4) > 0.8 was used to identify loci with enough colocalization power, and PP4/PP3
 > 0.9 was used to define those loci that show significant colocalization, described
 previously ¹².
- 466

467 Overlap with promoter Capture-C data

468

469 We used four promoter Capture-C datasets from three cell/tissue types to capture 470 physical interactions between gene promoters and their regulatory elements. We 471 employed three biological replicates of HepG2 liver carcinoma cells ⁵², another HepG2 dataset described in Selvarajan et al ^{12,20}, hepatocyte-like cells (HLC) produced by 472 473 differentiating three biological replicates of iPSCs, which in turn were generated from 474 peripheral blood mononuclear cells using a previously published protocol ¹⁹, and an adipose dataset obtained from Pan et al ²¹ that was produced using primary human 475 476 white adipocytes.

477

478 The detailed protocol to prepare HepG2 or HLC cells for the promoter Capture-C experiment is described in ⁵². Briefly, for each dataset, 10 million cells were used for 479 promoter Capture-C library generation. Custom capture baits were designed using an 480 Agilent SureSelect library design targeting both ends of DpnII restriction fragments 481 482 encompassing promoters (including alternative promoters) of all human coding genes, 483 noncoding RNA, antisense RNA, snRNA, miRNA, snoRNA, and lincRNA transcripts, 484 totaling 36,691 RNA baited fragments shows the custom bait map boundaries in hg19 485 coordinates). Each library was then sequenced on an Illumina NovoSeg (HLC), or 486 Illumina HiSeq 4000 (HLC), generating 1.6 billion read pairs per sample (50 base pair read length.) HiCUP ⁵³ was used to process the raw FastO files into loop calls; we then 487 used CHiCAGO ^{53,54} to define significant looping interactions; a default score of 5 was 488 489 defined as significant.

490

491 Starting with Capture-C maps processed as described above, we re-annotated the baits to gene IDs from Gencode v19⁵⁵ to ensure uniformity of gene annotations with the rest 492 493 of our pipeline. For each bait, we identified any gene whose transcription start site (TSS) 494 from any transcript in Gencode v19 was within 175 base pair distance from the bait to 495 account for differing bait designs for external datasets which may not directly overlap canonical TSS. From GRanges (version 1.42.0 run on R 4.0.2)⁵⁶, the findOverlaps function 496 497 was used for this annotation with the 'maxgap' input set to 175. The final result 498 annotated each bait to a unique gene name and Ensembl ID. The Ensembl IDs were 499 formatted to remove the ID suffix, which included all numeric values after the ".". All 500 datasets were additionally filtered to only include interactions in which the interacting 501 end was not another bait.

502 Overlap between promoter Capture-C data and GWAS credible sets 503 504

505 To identify genetic variants associated with any of the five lipid traits that physically 506 interact with locations in the genome that may influence lipid biology, we continued to 507 use the R package 'Genomic Ranges' ⁵⁶ to find overlap between previously defined credible sets for each traits' GWAS and the previously annotated promoter Capture-C 508 509 data, which we refer as Capture-C/GWAS interactions. For all individual variants within 510 all GWAS-associated loci for the five lipid traits, we identified which variants overlapped 511 any interacting end of the four previously annotated promoter Capture-C data. 512

513 Enrichment of colocalized gene-sentinel variant pairs in topologically associated domains 514

515 To compute enrichment of colocalized gene-sentinel pairs in the same TAD, we used publicly-available TADs from the liver ²⁴. We compared the number of colocalizations 516

517 with the sentinel variant and colocalized gene in the same TAD divided by all

- 518 colocalizations in which the sentinel variant lies in a TAD.
- 519

520 Enrichment in single cell data from liver and adipose

521

522 We overlapped our list of colocalized genes with publicly available single cell RNAsequencing data from cells in the liver ⁵⁷ and 38,408 cells from the adipose ⁵⁸. For both 523 datasets, we downloaded normalized TPM data and existing tSNE cluster annotations 524 525 for each cell. For each cluster, we defined median expression for each gene across all 526 cells in that cluster. Then for each cluster, we calculated the enrichment P-value for our 527 list of colocalized genes using the 'fgsea' R package, which looks for overrepresentation of our gene list in ranked genes for each cluster ⁵⁹, implemented in R 3.4.3. 528 529

530 Pathway Enrichment

531

We used ClusterProfiler v3.6.0⁶⁰ to look for pathways over-represented in each gene list 532 533 (genes with eQTL colocalization, and genes interacting with GWAS credible sets).

Specifically, we used the enrichKEGG function to look for pathway enrichment in KEGG 534

535 pathways. We first re-mapped gencode IDs to gene symbols using the Gencode v24

annotation and then used the biomaRt package ^{53,54,61} in R to convert gene symbols to 536

537 Entrez IDs, and then ran enrichKEGG to identify enriched pathways significant at a 538 Benjamini-Hochberg threshold of 0.05.

539

540 Stratified LD score regression for prioritizing tissues

541

- 542 We used LDSC version 1.0.1⁶² to estimate the enrichment of heritability of our summary
- 543 statistics in different epigenetic and transcriptomic annotations (including gene
- 544 expression from GTEx, and histone epigenetic marks from Roadmap), using python
- 545 2.7.9. We first converted the summary statistics for each phenotype to LDSC-formatted
- 546 summary statistics using 'munge_sumstats.py'. Then, we used 'ldsc.py' using the
- 547 baseline_v1.2 baseline model and 'Multitissuechromatin1000Gv3' and
- 548 'Multitissuegeneexpr1000Gv3' annotations to estimate enrichment of heritability, using
- 549 active chromatin marks and gene expression regularly. Links to downloaded files are in
- 550 Supplementary Information. For primary analyses, we used trans-ethnic GWAS
- summary statistics, and ld scores from 1000Genomes European samples.
- 552

553 References

- 554 1. Gallagher, M.D., and Chen-Plotkin, A.S. (2018). The Post-GWAS Era: From Association
 555 to Function. Am. J. Hum. Genet. *102*, 717–730.
- 2. Cano-Gamez, E., and Trynka, G. (2020). From GWAS to Function: Using Functional
 Genomics to Identify the Mechanisms Underlying Complex Diseases. Front. Genet. *11*,
 424.
- 3. Schaid, D.J., Chen, W., and Larson, N.B. (2018). From genome-wide associations to
 candidate causal variants by statistical fine-mapping. Nat. Rev. Genet. *19*, 491–504.
- 4. Smemo, S., Tena, J.J., Kim, K.-H., Gamazon, E.R., Sakabe, N.J., Gómez-Marín, C., Aneas,
 I., Credidio, F.L., Sobreira, D.R., Wasserman, N.F., et al. (2014). Obesity-associated
 variants within FTO form long-range functional connections with IRX3. Nature *507*, 371–
 375.
- 565 5. Consortium, T.G., and The GTEx Consortium (2020). The GTEx Consortium atlas of 566 genetic regulatory effects across human tissues. Science *369*, 1318–1330.
- 567 6. ENCODE Project Consortium (2012). An integrated encyclopedia of DNA elements in568 the human genome. Nature *489*, 57–74.
- 569 7. Loos, R.J.F., and Yeo, G.S.H. (2021). The genetics of obesity: from discovery to biology.570 Nat. Rev. Genet.
- 8. Huo, Y., Li, S., Liu, J., Li, X., and Luo, X.-J. (2019). Functional genomics reveal gene
 regulatory mechanisms underlying schizophrenia risk. Nat. Commun. *10*, 1–19.
- 573 9. Willer, C.J., Sanna, S., Jackson, A.U., Scuteri, A., Bonnycastle, L.L., Clarke, R., Heath, S.C.,
- 574 Timpson, N.J., Najjar, S.S., Stringham, H.M., et al. (2008). Newly identified loci that
- influence lipid concentrations and risk of coronary artery disease. Nat. Genet. *40*, 161–169.
- 577 10. Musunuru, K., Strong, A., Frank-Kamenetsky, M., Lee, N.E., Ahfeldt, T., Sachs, K.V., Li,

- X., Li, H., Kuperwasser, N., Ruda, V.M., et al. (2010). From noncoding variant to
 phenotype via SORT1 at the 1p13 cholesterol locus. Nature *466*, 714–719.
- 580 11. Neumeyer, S., Hemani, G., and Zeggini, E. (2020). Strengthening Causal Inference for
 581 Complex Disease Using Molecular Quantitative Trait Loci. Trends Mol. Med. *26*, 232–241.
- 582 12. Çalışkan, M., Manduchi, E., Rao, H.S., Segert, J.A., Beltrame, M.H., Trizzino, M., Park,
- 583 Y., Baker, S.W., Chesi, A., Johnson, M.E., et al. (2019). Genetic and Epigenetic Fine
- 584 Mapping of Complex Trait Associated Loci in the Human Liver. Am. J. Hum. Genet. *105*,585 89–107.
- 586 13. (2014). Obesity and FTO: Changing Focus at a Complex Locus. Cell Metab. *20*, 710–587 718.
- 588 14. Kanehisa, M., Sato, Y., Kawashima, M., Furumichi, M., and Tanabe, M. (2016). KEGG
 589 as a reference resource for gene and protein annotation. Nucleic Acids Res. *44*, D457–
 590 D462.
- 591 15. Landrum, M.J., Chitipiralla, S., Brown, G.R., Chen, C., Gu, B., Hart, J., Hoffman, D., Jang,
- W., Kaur, K., Liu, C., et al. (2020). ClinVar: improvements to accessing data. Nucleic Acids
 Res. *48*, D835–D844.
- 594 16. Blair, D.R., Lyttle, C.S., Mortensen, J.M., Bearden, C.F., Jensen, A.B., Khiabanian, H.,
 595 Melamed, R., Rabadan, R., Bernstam, E.V., Brunak, S., et al. (2013). A nondegenerate
 596 code of deleterious variants in Mendelian loci contributes to complex disease risk. Cell
 597 *155*,.
- 17. Teslovich, T.M., Musunuru, K., Smith, A.V., Edmondson, A.C., Stylianou, I.M., Koseki,
 M., Pirruccello, J.P., Ripatti, S., Chasman, D.I., Willer, C.J., et al. (2010). Biological, clinical
 and population relevance of 95 loci for blood lipids. Nature *466*, 707–713.
- 18. (2014). The 3D Genome in Transcriptional Regulation and Pluripotency. Cell StemCell *14*, 762–775.
- 19. Pashos, E.E., Park, Y., Wang, X., Raghavan, A., Yang, W., Abbey, D., Peters, D.T.,
- Arbelaez, J., Hernandez, M., Kuperwasser, N., et al. (2017). Large, Diverse Population
 Cohorts of hiPSCs and Derived Hepatocyte-like Cells Reveal Functional Genetic Variation
 at Blood Lipid-Associated Loci. Cell Stem Cell *20*, 558–570.e10.
- 607 20. Selvarajan, I., Toropainen, A., Garske, K.M., López Rodríguez, M., Ko, A., Miao, Z.,
 608 Kaminska, D., Õunap, K., Örd, T., Ravindran, A., et al. (2021). Integrative analysis of liver609 specific non-coding regulatory SNPs associated with the risk of coronary artery disease.
 610 Am. J. Hum. Genet. *108*, 411–430.
- 611 21. Pan, D.Z., Garske, K.M., Alvarez, M., Bhagat, Y.V., Boocock, J., Nikkola, E., Miao, Z.,
- Raulerson, C.K., Cantor, R.M., Civelek, M., et al. (2018). Integration of human adipocyte
- 613 chromosomal interactions with adipose gene expression prioritizes obesity-related
- 614 genes from GWAS. Nat. Commun. *9*, 1512.

- 615 22. Wakefield, J. (2009). Bayes factors for genome-wide association studies: comparison
 616 with P-values. Genet. Epidemiol. *33*, 79–86.
- 617 23. Yu, J., Hu, M., and Li, C. (2019). Joint analyses of multi-tissue Hi-C and eQTL data
 618 demonstrate close spatial proximity between eQTLs and their target genes. BMC Genet.
 619 *20*, 43.
- 24. Leung, D., Jung, I., Rajagopal, N., Schmitt, A., Selvaraj, S., Lee, A.Y., Yen, C.-A., Lin, S.,
 Lin, Y., Qiu, Y., et al. (2015). Integrative analysis of haplotype-resolved epigenomes
 across human tissues. Nature *518*, 350–354.
- 623 25. Hekselman, I., and Yeger-Lotem, E. (2020). Mechanisms of tissue and cell-type
 624 specificity in heritable traits and diseases. Nat. Rev. Genet. *21*, 137–150.
- 625 26. Pers, T.H., Karjalainen, J.M., Chan, Y., Westra, H.-J., Wood, A.R., Yang, J., Lui, J.C.,
- Vedantam, S., Gustafsson, S., Esko, T., et al. (2015). Biological interpretation of genome-
- 627 wide association studies using predicted gene functions. Nat. Commun. *6*, 5890.
- 27. Zhu, X., Duren, Z., and Wong, W.H. (2021). Modeling regulatory network topology
 improves genome-wide analyses of complex human traits. Nat. Commun. *12*, 2851.
- 28. Zhang, T., Chen, J., Tang, X., Luo, Q., Xu, D., and Yu, B. (2019). Interaction between
 adipocytes and high-density lipoprotein:new insights into the mechanism of obesityinduced dyslipidemia and atherosclerosis. Lipids Health Dis. *18*, 223.
- 633 29. Subramanian, A., Tamayo, P., Mootha, V.K., Mukherjee, S., Ebert, B.L., Gillette, M.A.,
 634 Paulovich, A., Pomeroy, S.L., Golub, T.R., Lander, E.S., et al. (2005). Gene set enrichment
 635 analysis: a knowledge-based approach for interpreting genome-wide expression
- 636 profiles. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. *102*, 15545–15550.
- 30. Degtyareva, A.O., Antontseva, E.V., and Merkulova, T.I. (2021). Regulatory SNPs:
 Altered Transcription Factor Binding Sites Implicated in Complex Traits and Diseases.
 Int. J. Mol. Sci. *22*,.
- 640 31. Schmidt, E.M., Zhang, J., Zhou, W., Chen, J., Mohlke, K.L., Eugene Chen, Y., and Willer,
- 641 C.J. (2015). GREGOR: evaluating global enrichment of trait-associated variants in
- epigenomic features using a systematic, data-driven approach. Bioinformatics *31*, 2601–2606.
- 32. Tripathi, M., Yen, P.M., and Singh, B.K. (2020). Estrogen-Related Receptor Alpha: An
 Under-Appreciated Potential Target for the Treatment of Metabolic Diseases. Int. J. Mol.
 Sci. *21*,.
- 647 33. Saykally, J.N., Dogan, S., Cleary, M.P., and Sanders, M.M. (2009). The ZEB1
- 648 Transcription Factor Is a Novel Repressor of Adiposity in Female Mice. PLoS One *4*,649 e8460.
- 34. Gubelmann, C., Schwalie, P.C., Raghav, S.K., Röder, E., Delessa, T., Kiehlmann, E.,
 Waszak, S.M., Corsinotti, A., Udin, G., Holcombe, W., et al. (2014). Identification of the

- transcription factor ZEB1 as a central component of the adipogenic gene regulatorynetwork. Elife *3*, e03346.
- 35. Neuschwander-Tetri, B.A. (2015). Retinoid X receptor: the forgotten partner in
 regulating lipid metabolism? Am. J. Clin. Nutr. *102*, 5–6.

36. Willer, C.J., Schmidt, E.M., Sengupta, S., Peloso, G.M., Gustafsson, S., Kanoni, S.,
Ganna, A., Chen, J., Buchkovich, M.L., Mora, S., et al. (2013). Discovery and refinement of
loci associated with lipid levels. Nat. Genet. *45*, 1274–1283.

37. Boyle, A.P., Hong, E.L., Hariharan, M., Cheng, Y., Schaub, M.A., Kasowski, M.,
Karczewski, K.J., Park, J., Hitz, B.C., Weng, S., et al. (2012). Annotation of functional
variation in personal genomes using RegulomeDB. Genome Research *22*, 1790–1797.

38. Anastasia, I., Ilacqua, N., Raimondi, A., Lemieux, P., Ghandehari-Alavijeh, R., Faure, G.,
Mekhedov, S.L., Williams, K.J., Caicci, F., Valle, G., et al. (2021). Mitochondria-rough-ER
contacts in the liver regulate systemic lipid homeostasis. Cell Rep. *34*, 108873.

- 665 39. Jurgens, S.J., Choi, S.H., Morrill, V.N., Chaffin, M., Pirruccello, J.P., Halford, J.L., Weng,
- 666 L.-C., Nauffal, V., Roselli, C., Hall, A.W., et al. (2020). Rare Genetic Variation Underlying
- 667 Human Diseases and Traits: Results from 200,000 Individuals in the UK Biobank.
- 40. Loos, R.J.F. (2016). CREBRF variant increases obesity risk and protects against
 diabetes in Samoans. Nat. Genet. *48*, 976–978.
- 41. Minster, R.L., Hawley, N.L., Su, C.-T., Sun, G., Kershaw, E.E., Cheng, H., Buhule, O.D.,
- 671 Lin, J., Reupena, M.S., Viali, S. 'itea, et al. (2016). A thrifty variant in CREBRF strongly
- 672 influences body mass index in Samoans. Nat. Genet. *48*, 1049–1054.
- 42. Klarin, D., Damrauer, S.M., Cho, K., Sun, Y.V., Teslovich, T.M., Honerlaw, J., Gagnon,
- D.R., DuVall, S.L., Li, J., Peloso, G.M., et al. (2018). Genetics of blood lipids among
 ~300,000 multi-ethnic participants of the Million Veteran Program. Nat. Genet. *50*, 1514–
 1523.
- 43. Li, Z., Votava, J.A., Zajac, G.J.M., Nguyen, J.N., Leyva Jaimes, F.B., Ly, S.M., Brinkman,
- J.A., De Giorgi, M., Kaul, S., Green, C.L., et al. (2020). Integrating Mouse and Human
- 679 Genetic Data to Move beyond GWAS and Identify Causal Genes in Cholesterol680 Metabolism. Cell Metab. *31*, 741–754.e5.
- 44. Varshney, A., VanRenterghem, H., Orchard, P., Boyle, A.P., Stitzel, M.L., Ucar, D., and
- 682 Parker, S.C.J. (2019). Cell Specificity of Human Regulatory Annotations and Their Genetic
- 683 Effects on Gene Expression. Genetics *211*, 549–562.
- 45. van der Wijst, M.G.P., de Vries, D.H., Groot, H.E., Trynka, G., Hon, C.C., Bonder, M.J.,
 Stegle, O., Nawijn, M.C., Idaghdour, Y., van der Harst, P., et al. (2020). Science Forum: The
 single-cell eQTLGen consortium.
- 46. Arvanitis, M., Tayeb, K., Strober, B.J., and Battle, A. (2021). Redefining tissuespecificity of genetic regulation of gene expression in the presence of allelic

689 heterogeneity. medRxiv 2021.06.28.21259545.

47. Zhu, X., and Stephens, M. (2017). BAYESIAN LARGE-SCALE MULTIPLE REGRESSION
WITH SUMMARY STATISTICS FROM GENOME-WIDE ASSOCIATION STUDIES. Ann. Appl.
Stat. *11*, 1561–1592.

48. Wojcik, G.L., Graff, M., Nishimura, K.K., Tao, R., Haessler, J., Gignoux, C.R., Highland,
H.M., Patel, Y.M., Sorokin, E.P., Avery, C.L., et al. (2019). Genetic analyses of diverse
populations improves discovery for complex traits. Nature *570*, 514–518.

- 49. Mägi, R., Horikoshi, M., Sofer, T., Mahajan, A., Kitajima, H., Franceschini, N.,
 McCarthy, M.I., COGENT-Kidney Consortium, T2D-GENES Consortium, and Morris, A.P.
 (2017). Trans-ethnic meta-regression of genome-wide association studies accounting for
 ancestry increases power for discovery and improves fine-mapping resolution. Hum.
 Mol. Genet. *26*, 3639–3650.
- 50. Kuhn, R.M., Haussler, D., and Kent, W.J. (2013). The UCSC genome browser and
 associated tools. Brief. Bioinform. *14*, 144–161.
- 51. Giambartolomei, C., Vukcevic, D., Schadt, E.E., Franke, L., Hingorani, A.D., Wallace, C.,
- and Plagnol, V. (2014). Bayesian test for colocalisation between pairs of genetic
- association studies using summary statistics. PLoS Genet. *10*, e1004383.

52. Chesi, A., Wagley, Y., Johnson, M.E., Manduchi, E., Su, C., Lu, S., Leonard, M.E., Hodge,
K.M., Pippin, J.A., Hankenson, K.D., et al. (2019). Genome-scale Capture C promoter
interactions implicate effector genes at GWAS loci for bone mineral density. Nat.
Commun. *10*, 1260.

53. Wingett, S., Ewels, P., Furlan-Magaril, M., Nagano, T., Schoenfelder, S., Fraser, P., and
Andrews, S. (2015). HiCUP: pipeline for mapping and processing Hi-C data. F1000Res. *4*,
1310.

- 54. Cairns, J., Freire-Pritchett, P., Wingett, S.W., Várnai, C., Dimond, A., Plagnol, V.,
- Zerbino, D., Schoenfelder, S., Javierre, B.-M., Osborne, C., et al. (2016). CHiCAGO: robust
 detection of DNA looping interactions in Capture Hi-C data. Genome Biol. *17*, 127.
- 716 55. Harrow, J., Frankish, A., Gonzalez, J.M., Tapanari, E., Diekhans, M., Kokocinski, F.,
- Aken, B.L., Barrell, D., Zadissa, A., Searle, S., et al. (2012). GENCODE: the reference
- human genome annotation for The ENCODE Project. Genome Res. *22*, 1760–1774.
- 56. Lawrence, M., Huber, W., Pagès, H., Aboyoun, P., Carlson, M., Gentleman, R., Morgan,
 M.T., and Carey, V.J. (2013). Software for computing and annotating genomic ranges.
 PLoS Comput. Biol. *9*, e1003118.
- 57. MacParland, S.A., Liu, J.C., Ma, X.-Z., Innes, B.T., Bartczak, A.M., Gage, B.K., Manuel, J.,
 Khuu, N., Echeverri, J., Linares, I., et al. (2018). Single cell RNA sequencing of human liver
 reveals distinct intrahepatic macrophage populations. Nat. Commun. *9*, 4383.
- 725 58. Single Cell Portal.

- 59. Korotkevich, G., Sukhov, V., Budin, N., Shpak, B., Artyomov, M.N., and Sergushichev,A. Fast gene set enrichment analysis.
- 60. Yu, G., Wang, L.-G., Han, Y., and He, Q.-Y. (2012). clusterProfiler: an R Package for
 Comparing Biological Themes Among Gene Clusters. OMICS: A Journal of Integrative
 Biology *16*, 284–287.
- 731 61. Durinck, S., Spellman, P.T., Birney, E., and Huber, W. (2009). Mapping identifiers for
- the integration of genomic datasets with the R/Bioconductor package biomaRt. Nat.Protoc. *4*, 1184–1191.
- Finucane, A., Carduff, E., Meade, R., Doyle, S., Fenning, S., Cumming, S., Hekerem, D.,
 Rahman, F., Lugton, J., Johnston, B., et al. (2021). Palliative care research promotion in
- 736 policy and practice: a knowledge exchange process. BMJ Support. Palliat. Care.

737